

Palliative nursing competencies required for different levels of palliative care provision: a qualitative analysis of healthcare professionals' perspectives.

<http://doi.org/10.1089/jpm.2020.0632>

ABSTRACT

Background: Nurses must possess adequate competencies to provide high-quality palliative care. Earlier statements have described certain competencies that are relevant for palliative care, yet only limited empirical research has focused on the perspective of healthcare professionals to clarify which competencies are required for different levels of palliative care provision.

Objective: The aim was to describe the required palliative nursing competencies of registered nurses aligned to different levels of palliative care provision, from the **perspectives of** multi-professional groups.

Design: A qualitative study design.

Setting/Subjects: A purposive sample of professionals, working in different levels of palliative care across various settings in Finland, was used to gain information about the aim of the study ($n=222$).

Measurements: Content analysis was applied to describe the competencies of registered nurses.

Results: Competencies relevant to basic palliative care were categorized under 17 main categories, which included a total of 75 subcategories. 'Competence in managing the most common symptoms' was the main category which contained the largest number of reduced expressions ($f=75$). An analysis of specialist palliative care data yielded 10 main categories, including 49 subcategories, with 'Competence in maintaining expertise and taking care of own well-being at work' containing the most reduced expressions.

Conclusion: The study provided **new** knowledge; more specifically, competencies related to encounters and maintaining hope were described as palliative care nursing competences. The results can be used to ensure that palliative nursing education focuses on the competences that are necessary in practice.

Keywords: Competences, Education, Nursing, Palliative care, Professional competence, Qualitative research

Introduction

Nurses are the largest professional group in healthcare, representing approximately 59% of all healthcare professionals¹ and the largest professional group involved in palliative care provision over a wide range of contexts.^{2,3} Palliative care is evolving rapidly due to increasing global demand, based mainly on population aging and the growing prevalence of non-communicable diseases.⁴

The **European Union** assembly considers access to palliative care as a human right.⁵ There are certain recommendations to develop palliative care and fully integrate it into the healthcare system.^{5,6} Nevertheless, it has been stated that palliative care has not reached an appropriate **quality standard** within Europe⁵ and that **its** provision requires adequate competence from the healthcare professionals involved.⁶

The World Health Organization defines palliative care as an approach to relieve and prevent suffering and improve the quality of life of patients and families burdened by life-threatening illness. It is an approach that addresses the physical, psychological, social and spiritual needs of the patient and their family.⁷ **Following** levels can be identified **in the provision of palliative care**: (1) the palliative care approach, which is provided in settings that do not

provide specialist palliative care, such as primary care, nursing homes and hospital wards; and (2) specialist palliative care settings, where the main focus is to provide palliative care by specialized professionals.⁸ The levels can also be defined as primary palliative care, whereby care is provided by non-specialists, and specialty palliative care, whereby care is provided by palliative care specialists.⁹ Thus, various forms and levels of education must exist, and reflect the competencies required to work in the distinct levels of palliative care.⁶

When providing quality palliative care, nurses are the professional group spending the most time with the patient and their closest ones. In this way, nurses coordinate care, ensure the continuity and quality of care, and support the patient and their family.^{10,11} In the context of nursing, competence covers a diverse set of knowledge, skills, values and attitudes that enable the nurse to care for their patient.^{12, 13} Appropriate palliative care nursing competencies are described as an antecedent, an ability that will enable nurses to deliver high-quality palliative care¹⁴.

The different levels of palliative care provision in Finland are defined in the current national recommendation¹⁵. The specialist level of palliative care is provided by hospital wards, hospices and palliative home-care units. The main focus in these units is on palliative care and, as such, the healthcare professionals working in this level of care should have specialized palliative care education¹⁵. In Finland, basic palliative care is provided across various care settings, including nursing homes and hospital wards. This level of care provides basic palliative care by non-specialist healthcare professionals and the undergraduate education should provide adequate competencies to provide the care.¹⁵ In this study, the expression 'specialist level competencies' refers to the competencies needed to provide palliative care in specialized contexts by specialized nurses, whereas the expression 'basic level competencies'

refers to the competencies that all non-specialized nurses providing basic palliative care should possess.

Nurses' palliative care education varies considerably in Finland.¹⁵ Sufficient education has been identified as a critical factor in the integration of palliative care into the healthcare system.¹⁶ When developing the education, there is a need to define the competencies aligned to the different levels. Previous research has rarely defined the palliative care nursing competencies that correspond to a distinct level of palliative care. Hence, there is a knowledge gap concerning which competencies nurses should possess to successfully work in different levels of palliative care.^{17, 18}

METHODS

This study aimed to describe the required palliative nursing competencies of registered nurses aligned to different levels of palliative care provision, from the **perspectives** of multi-professional groups. **To** present a comprehensive summary of the phenomenon of interest, a descriptive qualitative study design was applied¹⁹.

Data collection and sample

A purposive sample of professionals, working in different levels of palliative care across various settings, was invited to **provide** information in workshops about competencies relevant to different levels of palliative care. The workshops were organized in different parts of Finland. Before the recruitment began, the Ethical Committee of North Ostrobothnia's Hospital District was asked whether ethical approval would be **required**. The Ethical Committee stated that formal approval was not **required** because the study did not intervene with the professionals' integrity. Participating organizations were informed of the data

collection and they agreed with it. The sample (n=222) included representatives from a range of healthcare and patient organizations (Table 1).

(Table 1 here please)

Managers from each of the organizations were asked to propose the most appropriate representatives for the aim of the study. Individuals recommended by the managers were sent an invitation letter that included information on the purpose of the study, why the study was being conducted and those responsible for it.

Teachers from universities of applied sciences (UASs) participating in a national EduPal-project, whose aim is to develop palliative care education, organized the workshops. The workshops were organized either at the UASs or the workplaces of the workshop members. In some cases, a basic level group and a specialist level group were invited to the same workshop; in these instances, the workshops covered more than one working group (WG). In total, data were collected from 36 WGs in 21 workshops. The workshops were moderated by teachers of the UASs and, in two workshops, the research team members (H-L.M. & J.T.L) acted as the moderator. However, no participant-moderator relationships were formed before the start of the study. No persons other than the participants and moderators were present in the workshops.

A questionnaire was used to collect the data. The moderators started the workshops by presenting the study and the project, and by going through the instructions for the workshop activities. The participants were informed that their participation was voluntary and that the collected data would be treated anonymously. All the participants provided their informed

consent. The questionnaire was developed specifically for this study. It consisted of 10 open-ended questions covering competencies relevant to the field of palliative care, along with other aspects of palliative care development. The questionnaire had been pre-tested on one WG before data collection. The results of the pre-test indicated that no changes to the questionnaire were required; hence, the pre-test data could be included in the actual research data.

The participants discussed their views and documented their answers. In most cases, the answers were documented on paper, while a small portion of the WGs used computers to document their answers. The moderators did not participate in the discussions but were available for the purpose of clarifying any questions. Moreover, they observed the discussions and made field notes. [More detailed description of the data sampling is presented in our previous article regarding the competencies of physicians²⁰](#). The workshops lasted from two to four hours. This paper reports the findings from the data concerning the following questions:

1. What are the required palliative care nursing competencies of every registered nurse at the basic level?
2. What are the required palliative care nursing competencies of a specialized registered nurse at the specialist level?

Data analysis

Data collected from the workshops were transcribed verbatim. Qualitative content analysis was used in the analysis, with only the manifest content being analyzed. The unit of analysis was set as either a word, phrase, sentence or many sentences, i.e., anything constituting a unit of meaning. In the reduction phase, meaningful expressions related to the study questions

were coded. Codes were then grouped based on similarities in content. In the abstraction phase, subcategories and main categories were created and named based on their contents.²⁰¹ (Table 2) Two researchers (M.H. and H-L.M.) independently coded all the material. They compared the identified codes and, when differences were found, discussed the issue together to find a consensus. The first author (M.H.) created the categorization, which was then critically checked by two other research team members (H-L.M. and J.T.L.). The researchers made the final decisions regarding the analysis together as a team.²⁰¹ The analysis was performed manually. The number of codes was counted so that the frequencies (f) of codes for each category could be presented. Basic level data yielded 651 codes and specialist level data yielded 465 codes. Data saturation was achieved in both cases, which meant that no further data collection was necessary.²²⁴ *In reporting the findings, citations from the original data have been presented in italics.*

(Table 2 here please)

An inductive approach, i.e., categories emerging from the data, was applied in the analysis of the basic level data.²¹⁰ (Table 3) The analysis of specialist level data applied a combination of deductive and inductive approaches. (Table 4) More specifically, the analysis began in the first part with a deductive approach, followed by an inductive approach in the second part.

The first part of the specialist level data analysis applied a deductive approach. This means that the researcher operationalized a structured or unconstrained matrix of analysis based on previous knowledge, e.g., a theory or model.^{210,232} This approach was chosen because many WGs expressed that specialist nurses should possess the same competencies as nurses working at the basic level, along with additional competencies. Hence, the categories

representing basic level competencies were used as a structured matrix for the analysis of the specialist level data. In this part of the analysis, only data corresponding to the basic level main categories of the framework were coded. Secondly, codes that included new information that was unique to the specialist level were included in the analysis. They were abstracted inductively into new subcategories which belonged to the main categories that had been identified from the basic level data analysis.

The second part of the specialist level data analysis applied an inductive approach. This part of the analysis concentrated on the codes which were so unique to the specialist level that they did not fit into the structured matrix. As such, this part of the data analysis produced new main categories and subcategories.

The frequencies (f) of the codes constituting each category were counted to show the noteworthiness of the category in relation to the entirety. These frequencies are reported in association with the reporting of the categories.

FINDINGS

Nursing competencies required for basic level palliative care

The content analysis identified 17 main categories, including a total of 75 subcategories related to nursing competencies required for basic level palliative care. (Table 3). **Of these main categories** ‘Competence in managing the most common symptoms’ was the category which included the largest number of codes (f = 75). The subcategory **with the most codes** (f=30) was ‘Assessing the patient’s symptoms and defining the need for treatment’.

“Comprehensive monitoring of the client's symptoms (pain, shortness of breath, mood, nutrition, physical functioning, etc.). Using ESAS in the evaluation” (WG 31)

“Observes the patient's symptoms: physical, mental and social. Gives medicine based on the symptom, not by the clock... manages non-pharmacological treatment” (WG 6)

‘Competence in supporting the patient and her/his closest ones’ was another main category that included an extensive set of codes (f = 74). The subcategory which was constituted from the largest number of codes was ‘Identification of the need for, and implementation of, psychosocial support’ (f=20)

“adequate ability to ... support the patient with incurable illness and her/his closest ones.” (WG 30)

“supporting and calming down the patient/client and relatives.” (WG 18)

“The nurse should be able to give the patient a feeling of positive ... end of life (creating hope even if she/he is sick and dying).” (WG 21)

(Table 3 here please)

Nursing competencies required for specialist level palliative care

The first part of specialist level data, i.e., the data corresponding to the basic level main categories and the new subcategories unique for the specialist level, are shown in Table 4. Of the subcategories unique for the specialist level, most codes were included in ‘Participation as an expert in advanced care planning and setting goals of care’ (f=4) and ‘Addressing existential suffering’ (f=4).

“Understanding advanced situations when setting the goals of care/participating in the care discussion as an expert.” (WG 26)

“Recognizing the existential needs and support patients in difficult situations” (WG 28)

The second part of the content analysis of the specialist level data identified 10 main categories, which included a total of 37 subcategories (Table 4). The main category which included the largest number of codes was ‘Competence in maintaining expertise and taking care of own well-being at work’ (f=34).

“Updating knowledge with the help of education.” (WG 8)

“Reflection and identification of own resources and understanding their value.” (WG 26)

Another main category with a large number of codes (f=26) was ‘Advanced symptom management in nursing care of patients in palliative care’.

“Autonomous management of symptom care ... (Performing tasks related to other professions by task transfer).” (WG 26)

“management of specialist level symptom treatments.” (WG 16)

(Table 4 here please)

DISCUSSION

This study aimed toward describing the required palliative nursing competencies of registered nurses aligned to different levels of palliative care provision, from the perspectives of multi-professional groups. The results of the presented research highlight the competencies nurses need to possess when working on basic or specialist palliative care level.

Nursing competencies aligned to basic level palliative care

Both similarities and differences were found when comparing the results of this study with previous competence statements and literature. For example, competence in symptom management was the most emphasized main competence category. Symptom management has also been highlighted in earlier nursing competence research and statements,^{17,243-287} [as physicians competence²⁰](#) and in a [interprofessional competence framework.⁹](#)

‘Competence in supporting the patient and her/his closest ones’ and ‘Competence in encountering the patient and her/his closest ones’ were also often discussed in the WGs. Supporting the patient and family is a competence which has also been mentioned in earlier nursing competence reports.^{243-254, 276} The main category ‘Competence in supporting the patient and closest ones’ included the subcategory of ‘Maintenance of hope’. This means that nurses providing palliative care should have **the** competence to maintain hope among their patients and their closest ones. This area of competence has not been mentioned in earlier statements of nursing competence, even though maintaining hope has been shown to be important for patients throughout all phases of cancer care.²⁹⁸

The professionals considered encounters with the patient as an important aspect of palliative care nursing, with this main category described **as** respectful encountering, seeing the patient as a person and the encounter as a unique situation. Nurses should be present to patients and their family. The aspect of **encounters** with patients was described as being similar to the caring encounter concept,³⁰²⁹ yet it **had** not been widely mentioned earlier in conjunction with palliative nursing competencies.²⁴³⁻²⁸⁷

Many professionals from the WGs mentioned an unhesitant, or bold, attitude when providing palliative care. This need for courage was associated with the implementation of care,

encounters, being **present**, breaking bad news and when bringing along one's own expertise. This finding may reflect the need to develop and refine palliative care education, as it is already stated that palliative care professionals need to improve their competencies ³¹⁹. Nevertheless, courage in action was identified as a nursing competency in a recent study.¹⁰ Moreover, a study reported that developing competence through education can increase courage among nurses. ³²⁴

Competencies aligned to specialist palliative care

The content analysis identified certain competencies that were unique and specifically related to specialist palliative care. Nurses working at the specialist level of palliative care were perceived as professionals who coordinate the care of the patient and link the care between different levels and settings of palliative care. The results described nurses involved in specialist palliative care as **being** quite autonomous, due to their multiple roles in palliative care, a finding that has support from **earlier research**.¹⁷

Research and development of palliative care was identified as a competence area for specialized nurses, **as also in earlier literature**.²⁴³⁻²⁸⁷ Earlier literature has emphasized that participating in policy making is an aspect for specialist nurses.^{18,243,265,276,332} However, we did not identify competencies related to policy making from the specialist level data. This may reflect the fact that the role of specialist nurses is still at a stage of early development in Finland and/or that there can be limited opportunities for nurses to participate in policy making.

At both levels of palliative care, there were subcategories representing a small number of reduced expressions. Still, they are, nevertheless, important since they present the diverse competencies that nurses must possess to work in palliative care.

Strengths and limitations of the study

The trustworthiness of the study was ensured by choosing a research method that was suitable for the purpose of the study, as well as pretesting the questionnaire on a sample of participants.¹⁹ Moreover, the study sample was large and represented diverse settings and levels of care. All the university hospital catchment areas in Finland were covered. Therefore, it can be considered that the data represents the whole phenomenon of interest quite well.

The response rate could not be calculated since the working group nurses were suggested by managers at the participating organizations. The workshops were organized only once, and thus, there was no opportunity to ask the participants any further questions. An additional limitation was that the transcripts were not sent to the participants for correction and/or comments. Moreover, the results were not sent to the participants, and thus, they had no possibility to provide feedback.

Conclusions

Information from the data showed that nurses working in palliative care need to possess a wide range of competencies. Basic level and specialist level palliative care were found to differ in terms of the competencies required. The study provided new knowledge, as it reported encounters and the maintenance of hope as palliative care nursing competencies. Future avenues of research could aim to confirm the competencies identified in this study (especially encounters and the maintenance of hope) and reflect on how cultural differences

affect nursing competencies in palliative care. Curricula should always be developed to reflect the competencies nurses will need in practice. The information presented in the current paper can be utilized in critical assessments of how undergraduate and post-graduate education prepares nurses for a career in palliative care.

REFERENCES

1. World Health Organization. State of World's Nursing. Investing in Education, Jobs and Leadership. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization, 2020.
2. Fitch MI, Fliedner MC, O'Connor M. Nursing perspectives on palliative care 2015. *Ann Palliat Med.* 2015;4(3):150-155.
3. International Society of Nurses in Cancer Care. Position statement on palliative care and nursing. 2015. http://www.isncc.org/?page=Position_Statements. (last accessed August 31, 2020)
4. Arias-Casais N, Garralda E, Rhee JY, et al. EAPC Atlas of Palliative Care in Europe 2019. Vilvoorde, Netherlands: EAPC Press; 2019.
5. Parliamentary Assembly. The provision of palliative care in Europe. 2018. <https://brusano.brussels/wp-content/uploads/sites/40/2018/10/20180917-PalliativeCare-EN.pdf> (last accessed August 31, 2020)
6. Connor SR, Sepulveda Bermedo MC. Global atlas of palliative care at the end of life. World Health Organization and Worldwide Palliative Care Alliance. 2014. http://www.who.int/nmh/Global_Atlas_of_Palliative_Care.pdf (last accessed August 31, 2020)
7. World Health Organization. WHO definition of palliative care. 2020. <https://www.who.int/cancer/palliative/definition/en/> (last accessed June 31, 2020)

8. Radbruch L, Payne S. White paper on standards and norms for hospice and palliative care in Europe: part 1. *Eur J Palliat Care*. 2009;16(6):278–289.
9. National Consensus Project for Quality Palliative Care. *Clinical Practice Guidelines for Quality Palliative Care*, 4th edition. Richmond, VA: National Coalition for Hospice and Palliative Care; 2018. <https://www.nationalcoalitionhpc.org/ncp>. (last accessed January 9, 2021)
10. Haavisto E, Soikkeli-Jalonen A, Tonteri M, Hupli M. Nurses' required end-of-life care competence in health centres inpatient ward – a qualitative descriptive study. *Scand J Caring Sci*. 2020. doi: 10.1111/scs.12874
11. Sekse RJT, Hunskaar I, Ellingsen S. The nurse's role in palliative care: a qualitative metasynthesis. *J Clin Nurs*. 2018;27(1-2):e21-e38.
12. Cowan DT, Norman I, Coopamah VP. Competence in nursing practice: a controversial concept – a focused review of literature. *Nurse Educ Today* 2005;25(5):355-362.
13. Juntasopeepun P, Turale S, Kawabata H, Thientong H, Uesugi Y, Matsuo H. Psychometric evaluation of the Nurse Competence Scale: a cross-sectional study. *Nurs Health Sci*. 2019;21:487-93.
14. Kirkpatrick AJ, Cantrell MA, Smeltzer SC. A concept analysis of palliative care nursing: advancing nursing theory. *ANS Adv Nurs Sci*. 2017;40(4):356-369.
15. Saarto T, Finne-Soveri H, Expert working group. Recommendation on the provision and improvement of palliative care services in Finland Final report of the expert. Reports and Memorandums of the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health 2019:68. <http://urn.fi/URN:ISBN:978-952-00-4126-7> (last accessed January 9, 2021)
16. Centeno C, Garralda E, Carrasco JM, et al. The palliative care challenge: analysis of barriers and opportunities to integrate palliative care in Europe in the view of national associations. *J Palliat Med*. 2017;20(11):1195-1204.

17. Hökkä M, Martins Pereira S, Pölkki T, Kyngäs H, Hernández-Marrero P. Nursing competencies across different levels of palliative care provision: a systematic integrative review with thematic synthesis. *Palliat Med.* 2020;34(7):851–870
18. Martins Pereira S, Hernández-Marrero P, Pasman HR. et al. Nursing education on palliative care across Europe: Results and recommendations from the EAPC Taskforce on preparation for practice in palliative care nursing across the EU based on an online-survey and country reports. *Palliat Med.* 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269216320956817>
19. Polit DF, Beck CT. *Nursing Research: Generating and Assessing Evidence for Nursing Practice.* 10th ed. Philadelphia, PA: Wolters Kluwer Health/Lippincott Williams & Wilkins, 2017.
20. [Melender H-L, Hökkä M, Saarto T, Lehto J. The required competencies of physicians within palliative care from the perspectives of multi-professional expert groups: a qualitative study. *BMC Palliative Care.* 2020; 19:65. <https://rdcu.be/b341q>](#)
21. Kyngäs H, Mikkonen K, Kääriäinen M. (eds.). *The Application of Content Analysis in Nursing Science Research.* Cham, Switzerland: Springer Nature Switzerland AG, 2019.
22. Saunders B, Sim J, Kingstone T, et al. Saturation in qualitative research: exploring its conceptualization and operationalization. *Qual Quant.* 2018;52:1894–907.
23. Graneheim, U, Lindgren, Lundman B. Methodological challenges in qualitative content analysis: a discussion paper. *Nurse Educ Today.* 2017;56:29-34.
24. Ryan K, Connolly M, Charnley K, et al. Palliative Care Competence Framework. Health Service Executive. 2014. <http://aiihpcorg/education/competence/>. (last accessed January 9, 2021)
25. De Vlioger M, Gorchs N, Larkin P, Porchet F. *A Guide for the Development of Palliative Nurse Education in Europe.* Belgium: European Association for Palliative Care, 2004.

Formatted: Finnish

265. American Association of Colleges of Nursing. Preparing Graduate Nursing Students to Ensure Quality Palliative Care for the Seriously Ill & Their Families.

<https://www.aacnnursing.org/Portals/42/ELNEC/PDF/Graduate-CARES.pdf> (last accessed January 9, 2021)

Field Code Changed

276. Berry P, Bjarnason D, Boyd K et al. CARES: Competencies and recommendations for educating undergraduate nursing students preparing nurses to care for the seriously ill and their families. *J Prof Nurs.* 2016;32:78-84.

287. Hospice and Palliative Nurses Association. HPNA Standards for Clinical Education of Hospice and Palliative Nurses. <https://advancingexpertcare.org/education> (last assessed January 10, 2021)

Field Code Changed

298. Nierop-van Baalen, C., Grypdonck, M., Van Hecke, A., Verhaeghe S. Health professionals' dealing with hope in palliative patients with cancer, an explorative qualitative research. *Eur J Cancer Care* 2019;28:e12889, <https://doi.org/10.1111/ecc.12889>

Field Code Changed

3029. Holopainen G, Nyström L, Kasén A. The caring encounter in nursing. *Nurs Ethics.* 2019; 26:7-16.

310. Smets T, Pivodic L, Piers R, et al. The palliative care knowledge of nursing home staff: the EU FP7 PACE cross-sectional survey in 322 nursing homes in six European countries. *Palliat Med.* 2018;32:1487-1497.

324. Rotter B, Braband B. Confidence and competence in palliative care a comparison of traditional and nontraditional transfer nursing students' lived learning experiences. *J Hosp Palliat Nurs.* 2020;22:196-203.

332. American Association of Colleges of Nursing. Preparing graduate nursing students to ensure quality palliative care for the seriously ill & their families. 2018.

<https://www.aacnnursing.org/Portals/42/ELNEC/PDF/Graduate-CARES.pdf> (last accessed January 9, 2021)

