

# Shared values and one perspective?

Critical discourse analysis of online news articles on Helsinki underground tunnels in  
English published in 2017 and 2018

Kreetta Eksymä

Master's Thesis

English

Languages and Literature

Faculty of Humanities

University of Oulu

Spring 2022

## **Abstract**

This Master's Thesis presents the results of a Critical Discourse Analysis of English-language online news discourse. The qualitative study applied Fairclough's three-dimensional model on analyzing the online news discourse and the Discursive News Value Analysis for the analysis of the online news articles. The research questions were: what news values do the chosen articles foreground, what similarities and differences are there between news outlets under analysis, and what social or political wrongs does the news discourse under analysis sustain?

The analysis included nine online newspaper articles in English, five of which had been published in 2017 and four in 2018. The news articles for analysis were collected through the search engine Google and chosen based on the topic of the news: the underground tunnels in Helsinki. In determining the foregrounded news values, the analysis investigated both textual and visual features as a whole. According to the results, the main foregrounded news values in the 9 news articles were Eliteness, Negativity, Timeliness, and Unexpectedness. There were no significant differences between news outlets in the construction of news values, however, some minor differences in the emphasis on Unexpectedness and Timelines were found. The results of this study suggest that the construction of news values is not dependent on time, as the same news topic may be constructed Timely again within a year. Furthermore, according to this study, it seems that news value construction is not dependent on the geographical location, in this case, Australia, the US, or the UK, but further research is needed to confirm that.

The results of this study are in line with the previous CDA studies in finding that there are ideological standpoints and binary oppositions in the articles under analysis. For example, there was binary opposition constructed in the articles in the form of winners and losers. The articles represented the tunnels as having been constructed due to Russia's threat and war in mind—a view which has been publicly denied in Finland. Therefore, this study shows that the news under the analysis spread one-sided view on matters, as if from one perspective, thus sustaining the inequality of news discourse. The study suggests that more research on discourse practices is called for to reveal the processes that maintain the power relations.

*Keywords:* Critical Discourse Analysis, Discursive News Value Analysis, online news discourse

## Tiivistelmä

Tämä pro gradu -tutkielma käsittelee kvalitatiivista, kriittisen diskurssianalyysin alaan kuuluvaa englanninkielisen verkkouutisoinnin tutkimusta. Tutkimuksessa käytettiin Fairclough'n kolmiulotteista mallia verkkouutisdiskurssin tutkimiseen soveltaen diskursiivista uutisarvoanalyysi-mallia uutisisällön analyysiin. Tutkimuskysymykset olivat, mitä uutisarvoja uutisissa tuodaan etualalle, mitä samankaltaisuuksia ja erilaisuuksia uutislähteiden välillä on uutisarvojen diskursiivisessa rakentumisessa, ja mitä sosiaalisia tai poliittisia vääryyksiä valittu uutisdiskurssi ylläpitää? Tekstien analyysissa keskityttiin kielellisesti ja visuaalisesti uutisdiskurssissa rakentuvien uutisarvojen analysointiin diskurssilähtöisesti ja saatuja tuloksia tarkastellaan kriittisen diskurssianalyysin näkökulmasta.

Tutkimuksen aineisto kerättiin Google-hakukoneen avulla ja aineistoksi valikoitui aiheen perusteella yhdeksän englanninkielistä verkkouutisartikkelia, joista viisi on julkaistu vuonna 2017 ja neljä vuonna 2018. Uutisartikkeleiden aiheena on Helsingin alla olevat tunnelit. Tutkimustulosten mukaan uutisartikkeleissa rakentui pääasiassa seuraavia uutisarvoja: eliittisyys, negatiivisuus, ajankohtaisuus, sekä odottamattomuus. Merkittäviä eroja rakentumisessa ei uutislähteiden välillä todettu vähäisiä painotuseroja lukuun ottamatta. Tulosten mukaan uutisarvojen rakentuminen ei ole riippuvainen suoraan ajankohdasta, sillä samaa aihetta voidaan rakentaa diskursiivisesti ajankohtaiseksi vuotta myöhemmin. Lisäksi vaikuttaisi siltä, että uutisarvojen rakentumisen samankaltaisuus tai erilaisuus ei ole kytköksissä uutislähteen maantieteelliseen sijaintiin, jotka tässä aineistossa olivat Australia, Yhdysvallat ja Iso-Britannia. Aihe kaipaa lisää tutkimuksia vahvistusta varten.

Tulokset ovat linjassa aiempien kriittisen diskurssianalyysin tutkimustulosten kanssa siinä, että uutiset sisältävät ideologisia näkemyksiä ja rakentavat vastakohta-asetelmia. Uutisissa rakentui esimerkiksi voittaja-häviäjä-asetelma. Tämä tutkimus osoittaa myös, että uutisissa tunnelit väitetään rakennettaneen Venäjän uhkaa ja sotaa silmälläpitäen—näkemys, joka on julkisesti Suomen mediassa kiistetty. Täten tutkimuksessa osoitetaan analysoitavien uutisten levittävän yksipuolista tietoa kuin yhdestä näkökulmasta katsottuna ja siten ylläpitävän epätasa-arvoa uutisdiskurssissa. Tämän tutkimuksen mukaan diskurssikäytännöt kaipaavat lisää tutkimuksia, jotta valtasuhteet ja niitä ylläpitävät käytännöt paljastuisivat.

*Asiasanat:* kriittinen diskurssianalyysi, DNVA, uutisarvojen diskursiivinen rakentuminen, verkkouutisointi

## **Contents**

<b>1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>2 CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS IN THE STUDY OF NEWS DISCOURSE .....</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1 NEWS DISCOURSE DEFINED .....	5
2.1.1 Journalism as a performance .....	6
2.1.2 News as a product of a performance .....	7
2.2 CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF ONLINE NEWS DISCOURSE .....	11
2.2.1 Fairclough’s three-dimensional model in online news discourse.....	11
2.2.2 CDA studies on news discourse.....	14
<b>3 DISCURSIVE NEWS VALUE ANALYSIS OF ONLINE NEWS ARTICLES.....</b>	<b>18</b>
3.1 THE 10 NEWS VALUES OF DNVA.....	19
3.2 PREVIOUS DNVA RESEARCH ON NEWS .....	22
3.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND THE DATA COLLECTING METHOD IN THIS STUDY .....	26
3.4 THE RESEARCH MATERIAL AND SOURCES OF THE MATERIAL .....	28
<b>4 ANALYSIS OF FOREGROUNDED NEWS VALUES .....</b>	<b>32</b>
4.1 NEWS VALUES IN ARTICLES REFERRING TO ZAPAD IN 2017 .....	32
4.1.1 Eliteness .....	32
4.1.2 Negativity.....	35
4.1.3 Unexpectedness.....	38
4.1.4 Timeliness.....	39
4.2 NEWS VALUES IN ARTICLES PUBLISHED AROUND THE SUMMIT OF PUTIN AND TRUMP IN 2018.....	40
4.2.1 Eliteness .....	41
4.2.2 Negativity.....	43
4.2.3 Unexpectedness.....	45
4.2.4 Timeliness.....	46
4.3. SUMMARY OF THE FOREGROUNDED NEWS VALUES .....	47
<b>5 DISCUSSION.....</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>6 CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>56</b>

## 1 Introduction

This Master's Thesis presents the results of a Critical Discourse Analytical, CDA, study on English-language online news discourse that applied the Discursive News Value Analysis, DNVA, framework for the textual analysis of online news published in 2017–2018 about a specific topic: the underground tunnels in Helsinki. The CDA approach follows the three-dimensional model introduced by Fairclough (see e.g., 1997). The DNVA approach, introduced by Bednarek and Caple (2012a; 2017), bases on a long history of news value research dating back to Galtung and Ruge's study in 1965.

But first, it is best to discuss why study news? News texts are a discourse that has a great responsibility in providing timely and reliable information to the public. Journalism and especially the relationship it has with society and vice versa is complex, and news discourse is an important field for analysis because during the past decades, after the development of the Internet and technology, the news industry has undergone big changes as it has rapidly moved from mainly print to online content. This shift has affected not only the form of news by offering new, multimodal, platforms, but also the business model in its entirety. The results of such changes to news discourse, in general, are still called out for.

Secondly, this study builds upon the view that journalism is profoundly a performance. This notion forms the basis for this study. Through performative power, journalism can maintain power relations, produce realities, and affect decision-making and public opinion. Target audiences are oppressed under the power of journalism, especially so if depending solely on the information presented in news. This is especially the case regarding international news because of the language barrier audience does not have as many other possible sources of information about international topics. If the audience must rely on one source, and is, for example, unable to verify information from other sources because of language barriers, then the only source has all the influence and thus, more power in a society.

Because of the nature of news discourse's relationship with society and power, the CDA approach has been popular in analyzing news media representations: news media, more than any other, is not only an important means of influence because there are certain expectations towards news people have, but they are also ideological and increasingly marketized. CDA studies have shown that the news has the power to report on international topics subjectively (see e.g., Wang, 2017; Li 2009) and this study aims to contribute to that field of news research by focusing on

- a) English-language news of the same topic but different geographically based outlets,
- b) a news topic that has not been newsworthy in its source country, and
- c) is categorized as international news from a western country.

As stated, this CDA study follows the three-dimensional model introduced by Fairclough (1997). From the critical discourse analytical point of view, the aim of this qualitative study is two-fold: firstly, to analyze the construction of newsworthiness in English-language news articles, to discuss how the news is sold to readers as worthy of their time, and secondly, through the results, to discuss and make explicit the performative power journalism has within societies.

This study refers to terms such as construct and sell when talking about written representations of the world in the form of news. This is because among scholars it has been long accepted that language and news are incapable of representing matters of the world as true. The world is always looked at from some angle and through some lens, figuratively speaking. Interestingly, regardless of its proven incapability to provide objectiveness, journalism still relies on the expectation of truthfulness and objectiveness. Therefore, there still is the need for making explicit the powers of journalism.

This study does not discuss matters concerning their truthfulness, because this study builds upon the view that truth escapes definition (Broersma, 2010, p. 16). This study has no intention to make statements on the accuracy of the articles or the content presented in them because both are outside the scope of this paper. This study analyzes the content of the news articles, in relation to and in comparison to others, to exemplify the power of journalism. The aim of this is to increase knowledge of the matter to empower people.

There were two main reasons to choose DNVA for this study. First of all, at the time of research, no previous studies applying the CDA and DNVA frameworks similarly could be found. Secondly, the approach focuses on the discursive news values instead of cognitive ones, and on, for example, how the textual devices and visual features convey newsworthiness (Bednarek & Caple, 2012, p. 44), enabling the discussion of the news discourse from a social constructionism point of view. The focus is on the mediation of information, and therefore, this study does not aim to answer the question of why the

particular topic was selected for covering. Nor do I intend to speculate on whether journalists' choices were conscious or unintentional. Moreover, this study cannot make any generalizations on how others read and understand the news – or how they should, for that matter. I have carried out the analysis from my sociocultural standpoint as a citizen of the Fennoscandia and Nordic country of Finland, and the results should be interpreted only as such.

The research questions in this study are

1. What news values do the chosen articles foreground?
2. What similarities and differences are there between outlets?
3. What are the social or political wrongs this discourse sustains?

As stated at the beginning of this section, the research focuses on online news on one specific topic: the tunnels under Finland's capital Helsinki. I chose specifically this topic because in 2017, and later in 2018, the underground tunnels received a lot of attention in the news. The existence of the tunnels underground Helsinki, from my Finnish citizen point of view, has never reached such media attention in Finland nor has their existence been, in my experience, ever been connected to Russia. The articles under analysis were published by news outlets online in 2017 and 2018. All articles contended that the underground tunnels in Helsinki are used for preparations for the Russian invasion: a claim which raised discussion not only in Western media but also in Russia. The articles were an interesting object for research also because the publication dates are roughly a year apart and therefore it was possible to compare and discuss the construction of Timeliness.

The structure of this master's thesis is as follows: section 2 introduces the main concepts and the theoretical framework applied in this study. Section 3 introduces the methodological framework alongside the data collection method, research questions and research material. Section 4 includes three sub-sections, of which two are dedicated to presenting the found foregrounded news values with examples, each data set separately. Section 4.3 summarizes the DNVA findings and compares them to the findings of previous studies. Section 5 aims to discuss online news discourse from the CDA point of view. The main findings and shortages of this study as well as research suggestions for expanding the research are discussed in the last, concluding section.

## 2 Critical discourse analysis in the study of news discourse

As stated in the introduction, this study applies the Critical Discourse Analytical (CDA) approach to researching online news discourse and uses the methodological framework of Discursive News Value Analysis (DNVA), introduced by Monika Bednarek and Helen Caple (2012b, 2017), for that purpose. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is a form of Discourse Analysis, an interdisciplinary approach, which interest is in, as Wodak and Meyer (2001) put it, “dominance, discrimination, power and control as manifested in language” but with the aim to explore social inequality from a critical point of view “as it is expressed, signalled, constituted, legitimized and so on by language use (or in discourse)” (p. 3).

DNVA is applied in this study for exploring differences and similarities in the construction of newsworthiness between online news outlets under analysis. DNVA in general is interested in exploring “how the news is ‘sold’ (made newsworthy)” (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 22), and aims to “systematically analyse how semiotic resources construct newsworthiness in texts” (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 77). Analyzing the construction of newsworthiness with the DNVA framework enables the discussion and comparison of language use in online news discourse as well as supports bringing social discourse and power into the discussion. DNVA is a rather new approach, and yet not often applied in CDA research – latter a notion Bednarek & Caple pointed out already in 2014 (pp. 137–138; 2017, p. 36). Therefore, one of the aims was to explore how the DNVA framework works for CDA’s purposes.

This section introduces first the theoretical framework of CDA and its core ideology and concepts, before describing the methodological framework of DNVA in section 2.2. CDA has been applied in many fields, and here it is only introduced in relation to the news discourse analysis. Extensive introductions can be found elsewhere (see e.g., Carvalho, 2008; Wodak 2001).

### 2.1 News discourse defined

In short, in this study **discourse** is understood, as Fairclough put it, “use of language seen as a form of social practice” (Fairclough 1997, p. 7, p. 131) and **text**, use of language, is viewed as a product of that sociocultural practice: a form of language-use. **Discourse analysis**, then, is the analysis of “how texts work within sociocultural practice” (Fairclough 1997, p. 7).



Here, **text** as a term has a broader meaning than what is understood in everyday usage. Here the concept of text is understood as incorporating both verbal and visual material of news in the same way as do Bednarek and Caple in their DNVA framework (see e.g., 2012a, p. 18). More specifically, the use of language is understood here broadly, not only through one semiosis or modality but as multimodal, meaning “not being restricted to the semiotic system of language alone, but, crucially, also incorporating the semiotic system of images” (Bednarek & Caple 2012a, p. 2). Therefore, the construction of newsworthiness in the news article under analysis was evaluated by observing not only the textual features of news articles but also the visual features.

As stated before, this study focuses on **news discourse**, meaning the form of the social practice of journalism and news, and therefore other discourses will not be discussed here. News discourse is an umbrella term under which a variety of news discourse types exist.

### **2.1.1 Journalism as a performance**

From the journalism studies point of view, the description of journalism and news is something along the lines as follows (McQuail, 2013):

In everyday terms, journalism refers to the activities and outcomes of those professionally engaged in collecting, analyzing and publishing ‘news’. In turn, news can be defined as factual accounts and explanations of current or recent events of wider relevance to a given public, usually characterized by their geographical location (city, region, nation, etc.) (p. 2).

Thus, journalism is an umbrella term for the whole industry, and within that industry are a lot of varieties and diversity in how to “do” news and “who” does it. Some of those who are “professionally engaged in ... news” are called journalists, and they are those most often recognized by readers. However, news publishing is very rarely in the hands of one professional. Exhaustive descriptions can be found elsewhere (see e.g., McQuail, 2013; 2005), and this study focuses on introducing journalism as a discourse only where it relates to this study.

Journalism is not only something journalists “do”, but also something journalists and the public have expectations towards, and these expectations regulate the form, style, content, etc. of news. For example, news always is presented in a form that is recognizable and distinguishes it from advertising or literature: more specifically, news complies with conventions. These forms are different depending on whether the

news is broadcast, online article or print: print news has a headline, lead and main text, and perhaps images with captions, whereas broadcast news has other conventions regarding it.

The abovementioned expectations are people's (also those people "doing" journalism) expectations towards external factors: how news looks like. But there are also expectations towards news content: what is the subject of news and how it is presented. These expectations are called news values, and most often the term news values are used when referring to journalistic criteria about what topic (or event, person etc.) would interest the reader.

Broersma's (2010) notion of journalism as performative discourse entails that news is not viewed as empirical facts or neutral reflections of reality but as a social construction. What this means is that this study views news, like any other text or writing, as incapable of representing anything as what others might call 'the truth'. According to Broersma, the relationship between journalists and the public is based on the shared social code according to which journalism claims to be truthful and reliable, and the public believes these claims (2010, p. 16). He stated that "journalism derives its performative power from the forms and style employed" in journalistic discourse (ibid.). He argues that "...to ensure the effect of authenticity and truthfulness, journalistic texts rely on a set of professional practices, routines and textual conventions that were developed during the 20th century to guarantee that this process of construction or representation is as accurate—or mimetic—as possible" (2010, p. 17).

Furthermore, Broersma (2010) stated that "Reader's perceptions of the social world are determined by the complete, interconnected content, style, and form of a paper" and therefore journalism should be analyzed as integral discourse instead of merely focusing on the news itself (p. 16). Like Broersma stated, "News do not neutrally reflect social reality or empirical facts at all" (ibid.). This notion forms the basis for this study. News is viewed as a product of a performative discourse.

### **2.1.2 News as a product of a performance**

As described above, "journalism is the construction and publication of accounts of contemporary events, persons or circumstances of public significance or interest, based on information acquired from reliable sources" (McQuail, 2013, p. 14). News, then, is a product of journalism, and the form of news, the accounts of events and the medium of reports, vary. The most frequently occurring elements of news,

whether they are observed or recorded, is that they are “factual” reports of reality (McQuail, 2013, p. 15). In this study, the news is viewed as incapable of actually representing facts objectively.

For describing what is common for all news in news discourse, answering the question “what is news”, I cite Dennis McQuail, a very influential researcher in the field of Communication. McQuail (2013) characterized news as follows:

<b>Independence</b>	from sources, the objects of reporting, or vested interests
<b>Truthfulness</b>	factual accuracy and completeness in essentials, plus verifiability
<b>Objectivity</b>	the neutrality of perspective and lack of conscious bias
<b>Timeliness</b>	novelty and reference to or relevance for current events, but also being perishable
<b>Reflective</b>	in a proportional way, of ‘reality’ as far as possible
<b>Relevant</b>	to expected audience interests and believed relative significance
<b>Consistent</b>	in respect of the type of event regarded as ‘newsworthy’
<b>Narrativity</b>	taking a story-telling form and structure

**Table 1.** *Characteristics of news* (McQuail 2013, p. 16)

As seen above, news is characterized as news through three dimensions: not only by its form (narrativity) but also by its informational content and the relationship the content has with the surrounding society (timeliness, reflective, relevant, consistent), and all forms of news within news discourse fall into these categorizations (more about the three dimensions in 2.2).

There are, however, news types that each have unique features. Currently, the main news discourse types are those which, for example, Bednarek and Caple (2012a) name: online news discourse, print news discourse, radio news discourse, and televisual news discourse (see e.g., 2012a, p. 2–5), but it must be noted that there might be differences between research fields in how exactly the types are named. News discourse types, such as **online news discourse**, have features which are “specific to a particular media form” (Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p.104) and “there should be no assumption that what is typical of print news is also typical of online, radio, and TV news” (ibid.). This means that even though one of the

discourse types is proven to incorporate a feature, such as a distinct structure, it does not entail that other news discourse types incorporate that same feature. This is important to remember especially when analyzing research results.

As stated before, this study focuses solely on content from **online news discourse**. Online news discourse originated from print newspapers, however, right from its emergence, a variety of distinctive features of the new Internet environment on news were acknowledged, and unfortunately, not all of it can be discussed here (see more on history e.g., McQuail, 2005, p. 289; Branhurst & Nerone, 2001, pp. 283–295; Bednarek & Caple 2012a, pp. 28–33). At first, the emergence of online news was feared by some to “predict the demise of newspapers” (Branhurst & Nerone, 2001, p. 283). The digitalization process was rapid as by the end of the century many newspapers in the Americas and Europe had a website of their own (Branhurst & Nerone, 2001, p. 284). Still, after the turn of the century, online environments were seen merely acting as a “surrogate print medium” (Branhurst & Nerone, 2001, p. 284; see also McQuail, 2013, p.176) and providing “another stream of revenue” (Branhurst & Nerone, 2001, p. 289) for print newspaper outlets—quite different than now, twenty years later.

After the beginning of the new millennium, together with the development of the Internet and network connection technology, has the online news discourse become more distinguished and has the actual effects of the digital revolution on journalism become more comprehensible. The phenomenon is far too complex to be described here, but for example, Bednarek and Caple give a brief overview on the history of the online news history from the financing point of view (2012a, pp. 30–35) whereas McQuail goes deeper discussing it more widely (2013, pp. 171–195).

There are distinctive features to online news type. Firstly, online platform affects the visual categorization of the news content: for example, online news content is often divided with tabs whereas in print different sections are separated spatially and with labels from each other (Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p. 104). Thus, the tabs, from one point of view, give the reader the freedom to navigate between areas of interest with ease. On the other hand, web pages are quite fixed when it comes to the reading path of news, which often is forced to scroll down. Print newspapers have spatial freedom regarding the reading path, enabling readers free movement within a news page.

Secondly, unlike in print, in producing online news content, journalists have to take into account different usages than in print news, for example. Headlines are written keeping in mind the functions of search engines (Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p. 104). Online content has to be considered in relation to future use so that it appears in search results or can be found with a certain ease, whereas print news often does not have to accommodate such use.

Thirdly, in addition to the generally well-known visual material news discourse includes such as figures, typography, and tables (Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p. 18), websites provide a platform for multimedia content, enabling what Cotter refers to as “modality bleed” (2010, as cited in Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p. 107). This means that, when in the history for example news radios had mainly audio content and print news outlets had mainly printed content, the online environment of today enables outlets to offer a variety of content on their websites.

In addition to news discourse types, the news itself is divided into categories based on the content. Here I use Bell’s (1991, pp. 14–15) definition, which divided the genre of press news into four categories: ‘hard news’, features, special topics, and miscellaneous. Hard news is time-bound to immediacy whereas features and special-topic news, also known as soft news, are not (Bell, 1991, pp. 14–15). Hard news includes reports on conflicts and crimes, accidents and discoveries, and on all general news topics geographically unbound that have recently happened or become into knowledge. Feature articles, then, are longer and provide background and sometimes editorialize the news content (Bell, 1991, p. 14). Special-topic news is about a specific topic, such as sports or business, but news on politics Bell categorized as general news, and therefore political news may be either hard news or features (Bell, 1991, p. 15). The division between hard and soft news is applicable to today’s online news discourse. However, the fourth category, miscellaneous, includes visually distinct features of news that “cut across the first three” (Bell, 1991, p. 15). In this study, those visually distinct features are viewed as part of the news text: news texts are multimodal. However, this study does not focus on **multimodality** per se, even though it is an essential part of today’s news discourse research. More on multimodality can be read elsewhere (see e.g., on multimodality Kress, 2009; Kress & van Leeuwen, 2001; and Caple & Knox, 2015, on the multimodality of online news galleries).

To summarize, the news is the product of journalism, and journalism is a social construction. The online news articles analyzed in this paper are viewed as formed through journalistic conventions and their relationship with society, and ultimately, they are incapable of representing the matters of the world as true. News is a product of a performative discourse, and here are different discourse types of news and different news categories: various sub-performances. The next section introduces Fairclough's framework.

## **2.2 Critical analysis of online news discourse**

CDA is a form of discourse analysis and it emerged at the beginning of the 1990s from the symposium of Norman Fairclough, Gunther Kress, Theo van Leeuwen, Teun van Dijk, and Ruth Wodak (Wodak & Meyer, 2001, p. 4). Norman Fairclough has been one of the important contributors to CDA, and his theory is applied in this study for the analysis of online news discourse. The next section explains Fairclough's analytical framework in relation to the present study (including terms such as discourse, discourse practice, text, social practice, and order of discourse) before the next section that introduces some of the relevant previous studies on online news,

### **2.2.1 Fairclough's three-dimensional model in online news discourse**

Critical discourse analysis applied in this study is based on Fairclough's analytical framework introduced over thirty years ago. By 'critical' analysis Fairclough meant research that (Fairclough, 1997):

...aims to systematically explore often opaque relationships of causality and determination between a) discursive practices, events, texts, and b) wider social and cultural structures, relations and processes; to investigate how such practices, events and texts arise out of and are ideologically shaped by relations of power and struggles of power; and to explore how the opacity of these relationships between discourse and society is itself a factor securing power and hegemony .... (pp. 131–132).

Within the field of discourse analysis, Fairclough's approach has remained a timely one essentially because Fairclough's framework views the relationship between language use and society as interconnected and intertextual, highlighting that language use is not only shaped by society, but also shaping society. Such a social constructivist approach to language stands the test of time. Furthermore, the opaqueness Fairclough referred to still requires work and making explicit.

Discourse, as described earlier, is viewed as a social practice and language use that constitutes the effects of three dimensions: social identities, social relations, as well as systems of knowledge and beliefs (Fairclough, 1997, p. 131). This means that discourses are viewed as both, “socially shaped, but ... also socially shaping, or *constitutive*” (Fairclough, 1997, p. 131)—that discourse not only can itself change but also may change social practices. The discourse under analysis in this study is naturally the news discourse, described in 2.1. In this study, news discourse and its types are viewed as shaped by the Western societies and culture but also shaping the societies and cultures from within.

Discourses, then, are materialized as **discursive events**. According to Fairclough (1997),

Each discursive event has three dimensions or facets: it is spoken or written language *text*, it is an instance of *discourse practice* involving the production and interpretation of text, and it is a piece of *social practice*. These are three perspectives one can take upon, three complementary ways of reading, a complex social event (p. 133, emphasis original).

These facets, **text**, **discourse practice** and **social practice**, entail that each discursive event is an instance of language use, and each instance of language use can be analyzed as text, as discourse practice, or as social practice (Fairclough, 1997, p. 135). In this study, discursive events are the online news articles under analysis and they represent simultaneously three facets of the society: they are texts as instances of journalistic language use; they are examples of journalistic practices of a specific time and results of the journalistic production processes of that time; as well as representations of social practices in a broader sense. Each of these can be researched, and should, according to Fairclough (1997, p. 131).

In Fairclough’s model, discourse practices are viewed as mediators between texts and social practices, as depicted below in Example 1:

Text ↔ Discourse practice ↔ Social practice  
 \ mediator /

**Example 1.** *Dimensions of discursive events in Fairclough’s model*

Fairclough defines **texts** further as “social spaces in which two fundamental social processes simultaneously occur: cognition and representation of the world, and social interaction” (1997, p. 6). An online news article is thus a representative of the cognitive processes of the time as well as an image of

the world, but also a news article which has been intentionally produced specifically for communicating information – thus intentional social interaction. It must be noted, however, that Fairclough defined text as a written or spoken language (1997, p. 135), but as stated before, in this study, texts are viewed as multimodal, meaning that in addition to written and spoken language, other means of conveying meaning, such as visuals, are also viewed as texts. Texts are the online news articles under analysis.

**Discourse practices**, then, include the “production, distribution and consumption” of the texts defined above (1997, p. 135). In online news discourse, practices are therefore the news production, news distribution and news consumption. These discourse practices Fairclough views as the mediator between the dimensions or layers of discourse. **Social practices** are the ‘widest’ category to which the discursive practices and texts belong, incorporating the general rules and structures of communication as well as other wider and ideological changes that can affect language use. Fairclough uses the example of “marketization of universities” the institutional changes within the university around the time of collecting data, as well as the history of the university in relation to the abovementioned aspects (Fairclough, 1997, p. 148). In news discourse, an example of such a change in social practices would be the digitalization of news.

There is one more central term which is yet to be introduced: **order of discourse**. Discursive events, for example, news articles, are subjected to expectations regarding for example the visual appearance or the structure of the news article, expectations which are formed for example, by the environment discourse event takes place in or through the socio-historical context. These expectations could be also called conventions, but because of the complexity of the relationship between conventions and discursive events, as well as the possibility of multiple conventions affecting a discourse, Fairclough introduced the term order of discourse, instead. Fairclough defines the order of discourse as the “totality of discursive practices of an institution, and relations between them” (Fairclough, 1997, p. 132; p. 135). For instance, discursive practices within a classroom is an order of discourse (Fairclough, 1997, p. 132), and so are the discursive practices of a specific newsroom, or a printed news article of a specific news outlet.

Now that the relationship between texts, discourse practices and social practices has been described, it is easier to introduce how all of these relate to matters of the concept of power CDA is interested in. As stated at the beginning of this section, the constitution of discourse is affected by three dimensions: social



identities, social relations, and systems of knowledge and beliefs (Fairclough, 1997, p. 131). Now, there are differences in which social identities, which social relations and which systems of knowledge are prominent, and which are relatively obscure. Fairclough describes it as follows (Fairclough, 1997):

On the one hand, societies and particular institutions and domains within them sustain a variety of coexisting, contrasting and often competing discursive practices .... On the other hand, there is a complex relationship between particular discursive events (particular 'instances' of language use) and underlying conventions or norms of language use (p. 131).

Therefore, there are already existing instances that influence future development discourses. This means the **power** of influencing the constitution of discourses is not divided equally, nor are discourses welcoming to all changes. For example, in the news discourse, there are coexisting practices as well as orders of discourse, some of which intentional and some unconscious choices, that influence the course of development. In news discourse, some characteristics of news appear natural to the public nowadays: normally, the news items are published 24/7, news articles are accompanied by images and the articles on a page are arranged in article columns. However, none of these was typical features of discourse back in time, they have been naturalized over time. These are of course only examples of features of news discourse that are easily observed, and others more obscure and distinguished features do exist and will not be discussed here.

CDA aims to make such obscure features and opaque naturalizations explicit. Next, previous studies on online news discourse are introduced.

### **2.2.2 CDA studies on news discourse**

This section briefly introduces the main findings of previous CDA studies on news discourse and recapitulates why this study is a significant addition to the field of research. The results of previous CDA studies on news media give reason to argue that there are ideological differences between news outlets on how they represent events and topics. Especially the international news on distant and culturally differing nations—from the Western point of view—has been shown to include subjective representation regardless of the demand for truthfulness that the concept of news builds upon.

Ideological standpoints in the construction of news are by no means a new finding. For example, in 2009, Li compared 91 front-page articles from two newspapers, *The New York Times* and *China Daily*, focusing

on reports about two events: the NATO bombing of the Chinese Embassy in Yugoslavia and the collision of the USA and Chinese aircraft (Li, 2009, p. 87). According to the results, there were noticeable differences in the representations of events which hence created different understandings of the matters, thus revealing “the ideological position of each newspaper during moments of national conflicts” (Li, 2009, p. 105). For example, it could be shown that *The New York Times* excluded the voices of Chinese officials but included voices from NATO and Chinese protesters, thus creating a juxtaposition which highlighted “the extreme irrationality and recklessness” of the protestors (Li, 2009, p. 103). On the other hand, the *China Daily*’s article created “a divided ideological world between *us* (people in China ...) and *them* (NATO ...)” (Li, 2009, p. 104) by including in the articles several quotes from both protestors and social actors both in and outside China. Both western and eastern news media applied their ideologies in reporting the news.

A few years later, the study of Shojaei, Youssefi and Hosseini (2013) showed how the voice of Syria/Iran Officials was silenced in English-language news articles published in the UK and US. The articles under examination covered controversial topics of the Iran nuclear program, Iran sanctions and the Syria Crisis which researchers stated “Iranian officials and most of the western countries strongly differ” on (Shojaei, Youssefi & Hosseini, 2013, p. 858). The researchers selected ten articles based on their topic and examined the headlines and lead paragraphs focusing on lexicalization and collocational patterns, ideological square and intertextual framing (Shojaei, Youssefi & Hosseini, 2013, pp. 860–861). Shojaei, Youssefi and Hosseini’s study revealed that the western newspapers were biased in their reportages of the topics, indicating that such representations can result in “legitimation of one side and suppression of the other side” (Shojaei, Youssefi & Hosseini, 2013, p. 867). Regardless of the main tenet of news to pursue objectivity and truthfulness, newspapers still appear to report on international topics subjectively.

There are qualitative studies which suggest that the use of binary representation conforms to the ideologies of the society and foreign policy of the nation where the outlets are geographically based. Wang (2017) took a rather similar research approach as Shojaei et al. and analyzed eight online news articles from *The Guardian* and *The Telegraph* published between 1 October 2015 and the end of March 2016. The online news articles, all from British news outlets, covered the topic of stabbings incidents in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict (Wang, 2017, p. 79). Wang’s analysis showed “that violent actions are framed in a binary fashion, between self and other, and that the discursive strategies employed position

Palestinian subjects as unworthy victims or violent initiators, whereas Israelis were represented relatively positively, to inscribe the accepted values in British society and foreign policy” (Wang, 2017, p. 79). Wang resulted in that the articles seem to legitimize “Israel’s actions against Palestinians” (Wang, 2017, p. 90).

The phenomenon is not secluded only to the western news outlets or news in English, but it seems to occur more widely. For example, Ethelb (2016) analyzed and compared four online news articles describing the same event, protestors on the streets of Egypt, in the articles published by Aljazeera and Al-Arabiya: one article from each outlet in English and Arabic. The focus of Ethelb’s analysis was specifically on the textual devices of thematization, presupposition, transitivity, coherence and cohesion (Ethelb, 2016, p. 2249), and he provided also translations of the excerpts to exemplify his findings. The study revealed that the outlets differ in the way they present the subjects: Aljazeera represented protestors positively and police negatively, whereas Al-Arabiya did vice versa (Ethelb, 2016, p. 2252). Not only do the findings of Ethelb’s study support the argument that readers are subject to various interpretations of the matters of the world: but it also suggests that differences occur **between** news outlets, but not because of the language or geographical location of the outlet.

It appears thus quite well-established that news articles are prone to present actors in a binary fashion and that the representations of actors’ actions are not neutral regardless of the platform of publication: news articles tend to take ‘sides’. Based on the results of the three previously described pieces of research, news outlets are not objective in their reporting. This study aims to contribute to that field of news research by focusing on

- a) English-language news of the same topic but different geographically based outlets,
- b) a news topic that has not been newsworthy in its source country, and
- c) is categorized as international news from a western country.

This study focuses on articles about Finland since none of the found previous CDA research has focused solely on news content published in western media **about** a nation considered western. Furthermore, according to Fairclough, it is essential to discuss both sides of language use: the socially shaped, and the socially constitutive sides. Therefore, in this study, there is a focus on analyzing the online news articles

as well as discussing the social dimension of the news—how the discursive construction of news values has been socially shaped and the foregrounded news values also can shape society around them.

This study applies the DNVA framework for the analysis because it seems that critical discourse analysts do not consider the concept of news values usable very often, a notion Bednarek & Caple pointed out already in 2014 (137–138; 2017, p. 36). Only two search results were found from the scientific databases by using the keywords CDA and news values. Of these two, Bednarek & Caple's article was the other. The other mentions news values only in the abstract and does not further elaborate on this statement in their findings. The next section introduces the DNVA framework applied before introducing the research material.

### 3 Discursive News Value Analysis of online news articles

This study applies the framework of the Discursive News Value Analysis (henceforth DNVA), introduced by Monika Bednarek and Helen Caple (2012a, 2017) for exploring the socially shaped language use, noting the differences and similarities in the construction of newsworthiness between online news outlets that are based geographically distant locations. The analysis focused on naming the foregrounded **news values** of the news outlets.

Even though news values as a concept is not a new one, there exists no definitive descriptions of them and definitions vary between research fields. News values and newsworthiness have been conceptualized many times, first by Galtung and Ruge in 1965 (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 29). Caple and Bednarek offer an insightful cross-disciplinary review on the matter (2013, or shorter one 2017, pp. 27–39). Therefore, and due to the scope of this paper, the history of news value research nor the variety of conceptualizations will not be further elaborated here. It suffices to say that the differences in definitions base mostly on what the researcher considers as the definer or source of newsworthiness: may it be the reader, the producer of the news content, both, or some characteristic/feature of a text (Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p. 103).

Monika Bednarek and Helen Caple introduced their discursive approach to news values in its full length in 2017. Their framework aims to systematically analyze, **how** news values are communicated through discourse; how an event is construed as news (2017, p. 43). This is an important distinction to be made concerning other approaches that use the term news values. Bednarek and Caple do not imply that values equal discourse, or that values would only be constructed in discourse (*ibid*). On the contrary, they aim to take into consideration both the top-down aspect of social reproduction, as well as the “bottom-up” aspect (van Dijk). They use Fairclough's (1995) and van Dijk's (1998) notions on the relationship of text and culture when defining what discursive construction of news values means.

News values in the DNVA framework do not refer to any moral-ethical or commercial values of organizations (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 42): these Bednarek and Caple call news writing objectives and news cycle/market factors (2012a, p. 41) rather than news values. Instead of the more traditional cognitive approach to news values, Bednarek and Caple (2017; 2012a) take a discursive approach, focusing on **how** texts make topics appear newsworthy. In their framework, news values are considered

“socioculturally assigned, rather than ‘natural’ or ‘inherent’ in the event” (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 42) described in the news. The values are not considered as universal, for example, equally relevant all around the world, as Bednarek and Caple’s focus has been on English-language news.

Instead of offering completely new descriptions or listings of news values, Bednarek and Caple drew from previous definitions and adapt Bell’s descriptions (1991, pp. 151–160) and “conceptualize news values in terms of how newsworthiness is construed or established through discourse (both language and image)” (2012a, p. 104). They chose 10 values that have been recognized by many previous scholars (2017, p. 55).

Next, I will shortly introduce each by explaining briefly what kind of linguistic resources can be used for each news value.

### **3.1 The 10 news values of DNVA**

There are many linguistic devices which can be utilized in creating newsworthiness, and the following list is by no means exhaustive: linguistic resources may be used in various ways and for different purposes. The description is not intended to be comprehensive—merely exemplification. Bednarek and Caple put it (Bednarek & Caple, 2017):

First, there is no closed list of resources – news values can be constructed by an open-ended range of lexical or grammatical resources (word forms, lemmas, phrases, whole clauses, or sentences). ... Second, this framework should not be taken as an automatic checklist. Close attention needs to be paid to the meaning potential of the linguistic resource as used in the news story, as well as to the target audience and time/place of publication (p. 78).

Bednarek and Caple (2012) adapt Bell’s descriptions (1991, pp. 151–160) and “conceptualize news values in terms of how newsworthiness is construed or established through discourse (both language and image)” (p. 104). There are various devices which can be utilized to do that (p. 106).

The main linguistic devices used to construct these news values are

- Evaluative language,
- Intensification and quantification,
- Comparison,

- References to emotion,
- Negative vocabulary,
- Word combinations,
- Metaphor/Simile,
- Story structure,
- References to time and place,
- References to the nation/community,
- First-person plural pronouns,
- Role labels,
- Quotes from ordinary individuals, and
- References to individuals (2012a, pp. 46–56).

Furthermore, the relationship between the devices and the news values they construe is not fixed: each device can participate in construing differing news values depending on context and the way device is used. It is also possible that one device can construe simultaneously several news values. Below, Table 2 lists the 10 news values of the Bednarek and Caple’s framework.

<b>News value</b>	<b>Event’s discursive construction establishes:</b>
Aesthetic Appeal	Visual attractiveness
Eliteness	High status or fame
Impact	Significant effects or consequences
Negativity	Negative features such as crimes or disaster
Personalization	Personal or human face such as an eyewitness
Positivity	Positive features such as heroic acts
Proximity	Geographical or cultural closeness
Superlativeness	High intensity or large scope or scale
Timeliness	Timeliness in relation to the publication date
Unexpectedness	Unexpectedness such as strange or rare acts

**Table 2.** *News values and their definitions* (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 55)

The news value of **Consonance** is prominent if the event is depicted as typical and following the norms. This news value may be constructed using adjectives that generally are used when referring to typicality (typical, standard, ordinary), familiarity (well-known, renowned), traditionality (classical, conventional) or by using adverbs which convey the meaning of re-occurrence or repetition (once again).

**Eliteness** is a news value in which a news event is constructed as of high status and/or fame. This can be done in various ways depending on whether it is a case of a human or a nonhuman entity. For example, with humans involved, this could be done by referring to their roles or titles (Professor, expert) or by presenting the names of famous people as central in the news piece under analysis. High status can also be highlighted with adjectives that convey a meaning of importance, such as prestigious.

However, when an even or a feature of news is portrayed as having great meaning or consequences, then the news value of **Impact** is constructed. In such cases, the news includes idioms or phrases which bring forth the relevance of the consequences, including “abstract, material and mental effects” (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 79).

The news value of **Negativity** is constructed when the event or the article is somehow portrayed as negative: as Table 1 suggests, extreme examples of this would be those when an event is portrayed as a disaster, conflict, or criminal act. This can emerge through word choices which indicate negativity: what is generally socially viewed as bad (which is of course evaluative and context-dependent). Examples that Bednarek and Caple (2017) use as words for negative emotions and attitudes are distraught and condemn, negative evaluative language (terrible), and descriptions of negative behavior (break a promise).

**Personalization** has to do with presenting the story or its parts as “having a personal or human face” (2017, p. 88). This means that the news includes the experiences or representations of ordinary people. Often this is carried out by using eyewitness statements or by paraphrasing manners of things from the perspective of ordinary people rather than for example from the perspective of officials.

**Proximity**, as the name entails, has to do with the geographical or cultural closeness that is brought forth in the news. The most obvious ways to construct Proximity are through explicit references to familiar



places or communities, the use of adjectives that convey a meaning of closeness (here, home-grown), and inclusive first-person plural pronouns “our”.

**Superlativeness** can be constructed through devices such as quantifiers, intensifiers, and metaphors, to name a few. **Timeliness** is constructed when the news/event is portrayed as timely. News that includes temporal references such as “today”, is written in present or present perfect, or refers to time or seasonal aspects, construe the news value of Timeliness.

Lastly, there is the news value of **Unexpectedness**. An event that foregrounds aspects of strangeness, rareness and/or unusuality construes the news value of Unexpectedness. This is often done through the use of adjectives that convey the meaning of such, through comparisons, or by explicitly describing the emotions (e.g., surprised) of people (Bednarek & Caple, 2017).

### 3.2 Previous DNVA research on news

The first ones to conduct DNVA studies were naturally Bednarek and Caple themselves. Their approaches have been mainly quantitative throughout the years but have thus provided a solid base for future research. Bednarek & Caple (2012b) provided a brief close analysis of the online reporting on the website of the Sydney Morning Herald about floods in Queensland in 2011 (p. 106). They carried out a corpus linguistic analysis by comparing the 20 most frequent words of the news content to the 20 most frequent words found in the extract of four-million words from the British National Corpus that included a subset of British newspaper discourse. Bednarek and Caple (2012b) chose three words from the article which were not included in the top 70 in BNCB News and listed the words’ concordances (p. 108). Secondly, Bednarek and Caple (2012b) extracted and analyzed the headlines and sub-headlines, the latter of which mostly consisted of pull quotes, examining which linguistic devices were used and which news values those devices were associated with (p. 110). Thirdly, they listed quoted sources, and in which position those quoted sources were presented in that article; for example, as an eyewitness or an Elite source (Bednarek & Caple, 2012b, p.111). The analysis showed that in the case under examination, the reporting of the disaster foregrounded the news values of Negativity, Superlativeness and Impact (ibid.). More interestingly, “the principle photographic devices used in all of the images ... are negative elements and intensification, which construe the news values of Negativity, Impact and Superlativeness” (2012b, p.112).

In their later article, published in 2014, Bednarek and Caple provided short descriptions of two case studies, a corpus linguistic study of frequency and a keyword analysis of a particular topic. The latter one is of special interest regarding the study at hand. Bednarek and Caple compared 10 stories published in News2003 about a suicide bombing in Iraq, a distant foreign country, with 90 stories of nine other topics in total (2014, p. 149). The keyword analysis suggested that “the British media sold the event to its readers” by emphasizing the news values of Negativity, Personalization and Eliteness, instead of others (ibid.). Whereas Negativity can be considered quite understandable when reporting about a topic such as a suicide bombing, the presence of Eliteness is of more interest, especially as the elite persons quoted seem to be US citizens. Furthermore, the study showed that eye-witness statements of ordinary people are only rarely excluded, suggesting its possible importance as a news value in international news.

As Bednarek and Caple’s approach is rather new, not much research applying their method could be found. Huan’s (2016) study focused on “four prevalent news values related to news events or actors in Chinese press, namely Negativity, Positivity, Personalization and Eliteness” (p. 116). The article demonstrated “how the four selected news values are mediated through a nexus of practice”, and the examinations covered policy documents, news editorial meetings, journalists' professional beliefs and journalistic stances in news texts (p. 117). As such, it is a rare piece of research, as it is thus far the only DNVA study which included newsroom personnel in the research.

Most previous DNVA studies are corpus-analytic or computer-assisted quantitative studies. Studies which have focused on the cross-cultural comparison, have compared what we consider as Western news discourses to Asian and Western Asian news discourses. The research results are interesting. For example, Zhang and Caple (2021), conducted a study in which they focused on comparing the discursive construction of newsworthiness in news about the Chinese athlete Li Na. Their approach was corpus-analytic with corpora consisting of 278 articles from newspapers in China, the United States, the United Kingdom, and Australia, and the results found cross-cultural differences between news outlets in China and the West in **how** the news values are constructed, even though the news topic was the same and the constructed news values were the same (p. 79). Both, the domestic and international media, constructed the same news values of Eliteness, Superlativeness, Impact, Positivity, and Unexpectedness (ibid). Their study focused on sports news but, still, gives reason to believe that not only is DNVA a globally applicable

framework, considering the linguistic differences, but also one which enables discussion of different news discourses and cultures.

Another DNVA study, which focused on Western Asian hard news, suggests that there might be cross-cultural differences in *which* news values are constructed in a specific type of news. Crime reports are regarded widely as a typical example of “negative” news within the Western news discourse. Makki (2019; 2020) analyzed the construction of Positivity in crime reports and found that in the chosen two Iranian newspapers, Positivity was one of the main news values when reporting on crimes (p. 315). This phenomenon of Positivity occurring with news that, in Western cultures, would be inherently regarded as negative and thus thought to lack positive aspects, received further validation by the results of Zhang and Cheung’s recent study (2022). They found that in Chinese news coverage on epidemics, the news value of Positivity was frequently constructed (p. 16). Positivity, at least in the Chinese news discourse, has been previously argued to have a connection to the Chinese Socialist Core Value of harmony (He & Caple, 2020). The findings naturally require further research but, as such, confirm that DNVA is an effective framework to research the cultural differences between news discourses, and cannot provide results that could be viewed as applicable worldwide: the results are always culture-dependent.

The results of the study conducted by Zhang and Cheung (2022) suggested also that the construction of newsworthiness is subject to change, and perhaps in connection to sociocultural changes (p. 17). According to their research, while the Wall Street Journal’s reports on epidemics portrayed only a few diachronic changes in the construction of news values, China Daily prioritized geographic Proximity in SARS reporting, but Impact and Superlativeness in COVID-19 reports. This, according to Zhang and Cheung, was due to the differences between countries: “As a developed country, US has gone through less radical sociocultural changes than China, and therefore there is less motivation for drastic changes in journalistic practices” (ibid.). Their study, unfortunately, offered no validation for this argument, and such was perhaps out of the scope of their paper, but the finding nevertheless affirms that news values relating to a certain theme are not necessarily consistently constructed by a specific news outlet diachronically, and that DNVA offers means to observe and discuss the diachronic changes.

It can be summarized, thus, that recent comparative, corpus-linguistic DNVA studies comparing East Asian/Western Asian news discourses with the Western news discourse that I am accustomed to, have shown that:

- a) news values constructed in news about a specific topic can be the same between cultures,
- b) between cultures, the construction of a specific news value may differ,
- c) between cultures, the news values that are constructed may differ in form, and
- d) outlet's construction of news values may change in time.

But studies have shown that there are certain clear similarities and differences between Western news outlets, too, suggesting that it does not require great cultural differences between countries for differences in news value construction to occur.

For example, Fruttaldo and Venuti (2017), carried out a qualitative study for which they selected 12 news articles; 3 from the US, 3 from the UK, and 6 from Italian news outlets, all of which reported on the same, politically and culturally interesting, topic: the ruling of the Supreme Court on marriages of those of same-sex. All selected articles were news stories, but the data included as many Italian news articles as the others combined. What can be said based on the findings, the results showed that there were similar news values foregrounded and all sources constructed the news value of Impact. However, according to Fruttaldo and Venuti (2017), the UK and US outlets differed from Italian in foregrounding the news value of Negativity (p. 95). This is an interesting statement and one which, based on the article, seems to arise from the manner of presenting the case in the articles as a “battle” between opposing opinions (see pp. 88–89). Unfortunately, discussing the reasons behind this difference was out of the scope of their paper, but it does indicate an existence of a difference, which, at this stage, is grounds enough for further cross-cultural research.

Negativity has later shown to be a more complex news value in Western news discourse than anticipated. At least it sometimes surprises researchers by occurring in places it is not expected to occur. Bednarek, Caple, and Huan's (2021) DNVA research on the coverage of National Day of Australia showed that Negativity was one of the three most frequently constructed news values in the corpus of 136 articles. According to the researchers, Negativity was expected to play only a little or no role in covering a topic

such as a national day within the Australian corpus. Thus, the results of their study differed significantly from a similar study conducted on the US dataset by ben-Aaron (2003). Therefore, Bednarek, Caple, and Huan (2021) argued that “What we find for a particular newspaper ... in relation to a particular country’s national day ... cannot be predicted to hold for other newspapers and other countries or even other public holidays ...” (p. 718).

What can be concluded based on these studies is thus that even when the topic of news is locally accepted as positive or neutral, it does not entail that Negativity is not constructed. It seems that in both abovementioned studies, the presence and notion of Negativity opened an opportunity to discuss further the context and culture where news was published, and the meaning of the topic of the news in its context. This confirms that DNVA is, in terms of CDA research, a useful tool and makes possible the discussion of news more broadly, as CDA aims to.

The next section lists the research questions of this study as well as the data collecting method.

### **3.3 Research questions and the data collecting method in this study**

In summary, this study applies the CDA approach to researching online news discourse and views news as language use that inherently can constitute and reproduce inequality. The approach demands making explicit the researcher’s political commitment for changing “existing power relations in favor of oppressed social groups, aiming to produce enlightenment and prevent groups from delusion” (Wodak & Meyer, 2001, p. 11) because researchers are no more able to escape the influence of ideologies, background, culture etc. in their actions and choices than any others.

Thus, it must be highlighted that this study has from the beginning been interested in analyzing language use as a means of power and control, and has had the aim to reveal the social inequality that international news discourse incorporates, and to emancipate readers from that power and control through making the inequalities explicit. Therefore, in this study, there is a focus on analyzing online news articles and the foregrounded news values in them as well as discussing the social dimension of the news—how the discursive construction of news values has been socially shaped and the foregrounded news values also can shape society.

This section introduces the research questions and data collecting method applied in this study, before describing the research material of this study. There are three main research questions in this study:

1. What news values do the chosen articles foreground?
2. What similarities and differences are there between outlets?
3. What are the social or political wrongs this discourse sustains?

Foregrounded news values in this study are considered to be those which were constructed in the headline and lead and supported by main text and news images. Liked stated before, in this study news and news discourse are considered multimodal and also aural material is considered as text in this study. However, the analysis focuses only on verbal and visual aspects of news when analyzing the construction of newsworthiness, since aural texts were not significant in the research material of this study.

The articles under analysis have all been collected using an internet search engine. The search engine used for this study was Google, because, at the time, it globally dominated the search engine market (Johnson, 2022) and, from a subjective point of view, provided the most information, in an easy-to-follow format. Google search results may vary according to the browser's search history and other personal preferences, and I had previously for example searched for news about Finland when writing my bachelor's thesis. This, among other things, can alter the search results.

First, I did a Google search with keywords "Finland" and "site:mailonline.co.uk" because I was at first interested in what news had been published about Finland. Thus, the search results included all available articles on MailOnline that included the word Finland. Secondly, after choosing one search result of a suitable topic, about the Helsinki underground tunnels, I did a new search with new keywords "Helsinki", "underground" and "news", and adjusted the search settings to show all results published within two years, a year, and then within three months (in this case, April–June 2017). This way it was possible to see how many search results were news articles about the topic, published in two years, a year, and in three month period. Thirdly, I went through the search results and excluded the ones which were not relevant to this study. I found that there were few articles published about the topic in 2017 concerning the Zapad military exercise, and in 2018 concerning the summit of Putin and Trump. I chose articles from

well-known news websites and excluded results which were not news at all, resulting in four articles published in 2017, and five articles in 2018.

Then, I carried out a similar search to the one above, that included keywords in Finnish, for example, “Helsingin” and “maalaisset”, to see which news outlets had covered the topic within the chosen periods.

### **3.4 The research material and sources of the material**

According to the Google search described above, the news about tunnels connecting their existence to Russia was first published by Wall Street Journal in 2017 (Grove, 2017). Other news sources published their versions of it, some sooner, some later. The research material included 9 online news, four published in 2017 between July 14<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup>, and five news articles published in 2018 between July 15<sup>th</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup>. The news can be considered as ‘hard news’, meaning that the articles published in 2017 were published by the US- (*WSJ, IBT*) and UK-based (*Daily Mail Online, Daily Express*) news outlets and the articles published in 2018 were published by news outlets based in the US (CNN, New York Post) and Australia (9News, ABC, news.com.au). Chronologically, US-based outlets published the news first (WSJ.com in 2017 and CNN.com in 2018), and the others followed within a few days. All 9 news articles were from different news outlets as, according to the search carried out as described in section 3.3, none of the news outlets published about the same topic twice within the two-year timespan 2017–2018.

On websites, IBTimes, WSJ, 9News, and Express published the news under the category of World, whereas for CNN, the article is categorized more specifically under Europe. ABC, NYP, and MailOnline’s categorization is more broadly News, but news.com.au labeled the topic very specifically under Technology – Innovation – Military. Based on Bell’s categorization introduced at the end of section 2.1.2, the news articles are soft news, because the articles are longer than hard news, and offer some background on the topic of tunnels and Finland’s history with Russia. Furthermore, they seem to include editorial comments. Regardless of that, because the topic is political and refers to timely events, the news articles are categorized as hard news. The main distinction between soft and hard news is, after all, their time-boundness.

One search result (WT Editorial 2017) was excluded from the analysis because, even though published on a news website, it was an editorial piece and thus differed in its news type from the ones chosen.

Therefore, the number of articles published in 2018 included one more article than in 2017, but the difference is not significant for the results because in the 2018 set two of the articles were similar except for their headlines, NYP and news.com.au. The original headline of news.co.au may have been “The country preparing for World War III” or “World War 3: How Helsinki is preparing for war with Russia”, the former being the current headline for the article in reading view and not on the standard webpage and the latter that is the title of the tab.

The focus of this study is to analyze which news values are foregrounded, and it was expected that most articles foreground the same news values because the articles, regardless that there was roughly a year between their publication, were surprisingly similar in their structure and content. The theme also remained the same, but the articles differed in what event the tunnels were covered together with: in 2017 articles, the co-covered event was upcoming Russia’s military exercise Zapad near the Finnish border, and it was mentioned in all 2017 articles. In 2018 set, the event was the summit of President Donald Trump and President Vladimir Putin that took place in Helsinki. This division is also made visible in explaining the research results in section 4. Most often the leads connected the topic to a wider context, namely the events mentioned above, but not in all, as some merely complemented what had been said in the headline. There were differences in other aspects, too: altogether five articles described brief a history of Finland’s and Russia’s relationship, Wall Street Journal in 2017 and four in 2018; New York Post, ABC news, 9news, and news.com.au.

The news outlets that have published the news articles under analysis are geographically based in the United Kingdom (MailOnline, Express.co.uk), United States (New York Post, CNN.com, Wall Street Journal, IBTimes), and Australia (ABC, news.com.au), and some focus only on producing digital content whereas others have printed ones as well. Besides location and forms of publication, the outlets have differences regarding their monetizing system. Some news outlets are national and some commercial, but it must be noted that all articles under analysis here have been readable free of charge, apart from the Wall Street Journal which occasionally had a paywall for a short period.

It is also relevant to bear in mind that some news outlets have a longer history than others, and others are characterized as more sensationalistic than others. The outlets have not been chosen but, as described earlier in the section describing the data collection method in 3.3, the news articles were chosen based



on the topic. Furthermore, because this study focuses on online news articles, therefore the focus of the introduction is on outlets' websites and their coverage, to give an image of the reach of the articles under analysis.

The first outlets to be described are the UK-based outlets. Express.co.uk is the digital version of the news brands Daily Express and Sunday Express (Express). They are published by Express Newspapers which is a subsidiary company of Reach PLC –Britain's largest publisher of newspapers, magazines, and digital content. Express.co.uk is free to read both on the web and as an app (Express). Dailymail.co.uk, also known as MailOnline, is a brand of London-based DMG Media and has claimed to be the most widely read newspaper website in the world with 191 million visitors per month (MailOnline). MailOnline was launched in 2003 and converted to a separately managed site in 2006 (Bloomgarden-Smoke 2014). The site is described as picture-led, including an easily navigable format, and the London firm that created the MailOnline homepages won an award in 2013 “for its business driving design” (Bloomgarden-Smoke, 2014).

Out of the four United States-based outlets, CNN (Cable News Network) is the only cable news brand and a division of WarnerMedia (WarnerMedia). CNN Digital is one section of CNN, born in 1995 (Merrill & O'Key, 2020). It is headquartered in Atlanta, United States, but has a global team of nearly 4,000 professionals (CNN). Its website cnn.com is updated 24/7 and features the latest multimedia technologies (CNN). According to WarnerMedia, “CNN Digital is the #1 online news destination across all platforms, with more global and U.S. unique visitors and multiplatform video starts than any other competitor” (WarnerMedia).

International Business Times is a US-based online news publication (IBT), officially launched in 2006. It is part of IBT Media, and through its digital publishing platforms, it has globally an audience of over 15 million every month (IBTMedia). IBTimes is produced in 5 country editions, in four languages, and its content focuses on business, economic and political stories, as well as other areas of interest to global readers (IBTMedia).

The Wall Street Journal (WSJ) is U.S. based international daily newspaper published by Dow Jones, owned by News Corp. The WSJ focuses on business, economics and politics but covers also a variety of

topics: world news and politics to lifestyle and health (DOW). WSJ is described as “a critical resource of curated content in print, online and mobile apps, complete with breaking news streams, interactive features, video, online columns and blogs.”. The newspaper has “The Journal’s global digital offerings have grown to include 12 sites in six languages, edited locally for a regionally relevant focus” (DOW).

The New York Post and news.com.au are units of the News Corp, and News Corp is the largest print and digital publisher in Australia (NewsCorp). News Corp is a global diversified media and information services company, including for example cable network programming and distribution of pay-tv in Australia as well as book publishing and news services. NY Post was founded in 1801 being the oldest continuously published daily newspaper in the United States (NYP) and news.com.au also maintains its position as the most read news brand with 11.5 million readers (NewsCorp). News.com.au is Australia’s number one commercial news site (News.com.au).

ABC (Australian Broadcasting Company) is the national broadcasting company in Australia, launched in 1932 (ABCa). It developed from an only radio service to a multi-platform media operation it is now, being ahead of many other media companies when in 1995 launched its website [www.abc.net.au](http://www.abc.net.au) (ABCa). According to ABC, “the ABC is a statutory authority constituted and operating under the provisions of the Australian Broadcasting Corporation Act 1983” (ABCb).

The next section describes the results of the DNVA analysis.

## **4 Analysis of foregrounded news values**

In the following section, I explain how the foregrounded news values were constructed in the 9 English-language news articles. The analysis is divided into two, based on the publication year of the articles, 2017 and 2018, and these are discussed first in chronological order before a summarizing discussion in section 4.3.

### **4.1 News values in articles referring to Zapad in 2017**

The main news values constructed in the four news articles published in 2017 were Eliteness, Negativity, Timeliness, and Unexpectedness. Superlativeness was also frequently constructed, but it was used to emphasize other news values, most often Negativity and Unexpectedness, and therefore, it is not in this case discussed as a foregrounded news value on its own. It must be noted that each article followed each website's formatting conventions when it comes to the structure of a news story, for example, one of the articles had no sub-headline at all, and one had four. Both are typical formatting styles on their particular news websites. Sub-headlines offer more space for presenting what is considered the most interesting and central aspects of an article. Next, the foregrounding of each news value is discussed with examples.

#### **4.1.1 Eliteness**

As Bednarek and Caple stated, Eliteness is a scalar news value and “dependent on the target audience” (2017, p. 58), What is considered constructing Eliteness in other contexts and cultures, might not be such in others, and therefore some other audiences would not conclude in similar interpretations as made here. As mentioned before, Eliteness is a useful label in DNVA since the adjective elite can be used for referring to the importance of various entities. It does not convey meaning regarding negativity or positivity, and, it must be highlighted, that it is a news value which is entirely dependent on the audience (see e.g., p. 58–59, Bednarek & Caple, 2017).

Eliteness is a very prominent news value in these news articles and is construed consistently throughout the articles. The four articles under analysis constructed Eliteness in quite an identical manner mainly in two ways: through headlines and quotations. The first feature constructing Eliteness, and one that is first visible to the reader, too, is the headline. All headlines include a reference to nations in one form or another, bolded in Example 2 next.

WSJ	<i>Beneath Helsinki, <b>Finns</b> prepare for <b>Russian</b> Threat</i>
IBTimes	<i><b>Helsinki</b> Prepares For <b>Russian</b> Military Exercise By Going Underground</i>
Express	<i><b>EU country</b> builds massive underground CITY to prepare for <b>Russian</b> invasion</i>
MailOnline	<i>Finland prepares to go underground if the <b>Russians</b> attack: Massive tunnel network in Helsinki is developed for soldiers to 'gain an advantage' if there is an invasion</i>

**Example 2.** *Construction of Eliteness in headlines of the 2017 set (emphasis added)*

As shown in the example above, all headlines connect the reason behind the building and preparation of tunnels to a nation, Russia. This constructs the news value of Eliteness because Russia can be considered an elite nation, as it has influence and is internationally recognized as having power. It is also represented in the headlines as having a status important enough to elicit such actions. In addition to referring to nations, there are mentions of organizations and unions that do not require further explanation. An example from the main text of the Wall Street Journal article:

Russia's war games will take place on Finland's border as the **North Atlantic Treaty Organization** steps up its own presence in the Baltics, across the Gulf of Finland. The country is in **the European Union**, but not a member of **NATO** (Grove, 2017, emphasis added).

NATO is mentioned in all the articles of the set, often as a counterpart to Russia, as in the IBTimes' case: "NATO officials said they will be vigilant during the Zapad military exercises, as they are the first ones Russia and Belarus will be conducting since **Russia-NATO relations** weakened after the Ukraine crisis" (Cobos, 2017, emphasis added). Bolded in the quotation is the part that insinuates the equal amount of influence that counterparts have. The organizations are considered well-known even though their role on the matter is not elaborated further: news staff estimated that an average reader knows why EU membership in this context is relevant to mention and what significance the preparedness of NATO has to Russia's 'war games'. Therefore, they are considered as constructing Eliteness.

Eliteness is also construed and foregrounded through elite quotes. For example, in the Wall Street Journal's article, there are 12 quotations in total and all sources can be viewed as members of the elite.

1. ...said a former Finnish Defense Ministry Official.
2. ...said Jarno Linnell, a Finnish expert on cybersecurity and military science.
3. ...said Ilkka Vahaaho [sic], an employee of the city of Helsinki's real estate department.
4. ...though government defense strategists say...
5. ...independent defense analyst Petri Makela [sic] said.
6. Finnish authorities say...
7. ...said Janne Kuusela, the Defense Ministry's policy director.
8. ...he (Kuusela) said.
9. High-ranking officials here say...
10. Finnish authorities say...
11. Finland says...
12. ... said Mr. Kuusela.

**Example 3.** *Examples of the Elite sources in the WSJ news*

Elite quotations are used for both elaborating more on the tunnels and their significance, when citing Finnish elite members, and for creating more importance and reliability on the topic altogether when citing others. Sometimes 'hard news' includes comments given by ordinary people that would construct Personalization, but this is not the case in any of the articles under analysis, as no quotations from 'ordinary people' are present. Elite quotations are consistently used throughout articles. In addition to the abovementioned sources, members of or the collective of Finnish authorities, IBTimes included an indirect quote from NATO as well, as seen in the quotation mentioned above.

There is one more feature that is used in the articles for constructing Eliteness that has yet not been discussed: images. As the focus of the analysis is to identify the foregrounded news values and explain how they are foregrounded, the visual communication is not discussed here in-depth. However, a brief notion of the image's significance to the matter is pointed out. There are two ways in which images construe a news value of Eliteness in the articles under analysis. Firstly, by depicting an elite member, Putin in this case.

Express foregrounded Eliteness the most, having a leading image of an 'elite member'. All in all, two of the articles under analysis included an image of an elite member, MailOnline and Express.co.uk, whereas

the other two news articles did not. IBTimes' article was the only article that did not include images at all. The use of the elite image is not surprising, because, generally, if a news article includes an image of an elite person, there is also a reference to that person in the main text and headline. Conversely, it is very common that news that somehow refers to an elite person also includes an image of them.

Secondly, and more interestingly, in three of the news articles, images constructed Eliteness by naming an elite source as **the source of the image**. It is common to name sources of images to adhere to copyright and other rules that ensure the fair use of images. However, the named source can affect the construction of news values. An image from an official source such as a city or a government and so on can more construct Eliteness than say, an image by a journalist or a bystander, the latter of which becoming nowadays increasingly common in news. Surely, it creates a different interpretation for a reader if an image has been captured for example by a journalist or bystander. In the articles under analysis, the Elite sources are "City of Helsinki" and "City of Helsinki Real Estate Department". Note, that not all images were named coming from official sources: for example, MailOnline included 9 images out of 10 as from an Elite source, and Express 1 ½ from three. This "officiality" of an image increases its importance and reliability.

#### 4.1.2 Negativity

Negativity is a foregrounded news value in the 2017 set because headlines include words that have a negative connotation. As stated in the introduction to this section, articles differ slightly on how much emphasis there is on Negativity. IBTimes has less emphasis on Negativity and is more neutral in the choice of words, as well as includes no images. To begin with, the headlines, as seen in the example below, the IBTimes headline constructs Negativity the least:

WSJ	<i>Beneath Helsinki, Finns prepare for <b>Russian Threat</b></i>
IBTimes	<i>Helsinki Prepares For <b>Russian Military Exercise</b> By Going Underground</i>
Express	<i>EU country builds massive underground CITY to prepare for <b>Russian invasion</b></i>
MailOnline	<i>Finland prepares to go underground if the <b>Russians attack</b>: Massive tunnel network in Helsinki is developed for soldiers to 'gain an advantage' if there is <b>an invasion</b></i>

**Example 4.** *Examples of constructing Negativity in 2017 news article headlines (emphasis added)*

The Wall Street Journal article’s headline names Russia as a “threat”, which is inherently a noun that has a negative connotation, meaning “something that may cause injury or harm” (Merriam-Webster, n.d.). The Express’ headline, on the other hand, implies the possibility of an invasion, which, by definition, is “a sudden attack on and entrance into hostile territory” (Merriam-Webster, n.d.). The headlines are here regarded as constructing Negativity since there was no mention in the articles that an invasion is imminent, nor did quotes from officials imply such.

The same tendency is also seen in the leads, as shown in Example 5 below.

WSJ	<i>Russia is planning its military exercise in years and its neighbor Finland is going underground</i>
IBTimes	<i>An underground city in Helsinki, Finland has further secured itself in preparation for Russia’s <b>biggest military exercise</b> in years, reported the Wall Street Journal Thursday</i>
Express	<i>Hundreds of miles of tunnels underneath Helsinki, Finland, have been <b>painstakingly</b> constructed in the case of an <b>emergency</b></i>
MailOnline	<i>Finnish soldiers are carrying out training in a complex network of tunnels underneath Helsinki <b>amid fears of a Russian invasion</b></i>

**Example 5.** *Examples of construction of Negativity in 2017 leads* (emphasis added)

The WSJ article construes the news value of Negativity by negative vocabulary and its intensification. Most obvious examples of negative vocabulary are military-related words (“military exercise”, “crucial line of defense”, “war games”) and words that carry a negative meaning (“threat”, “aggressive”, “enemy”, “worst-case scenario”), as seen in the example above. Military-related words are considered negative as their use builds up a lexical field of confrontation and need for defense.

According to Bednarek and Caple (2012a), linguistic means of intensification and quantification include devices to intensify for example number, amount, size, degree, or force, and these devices often construe the news value of Superlativeness (p. 47). However, in this study, these devices are found to intensify

Negativity and are thus not analyzed as constructing the value of Superlativeness but Negativity. See the examples from the Wall Street Journal article below.

“Russia is planning its biggest military exercise **in years**, ...”

“A subterranean city beneath Helsinki forms a **crucial** line of defense for the capital.”

“...Russia readies for Zapad 2017, the country’s **largest** military exercise ...”

**Example 6.** *Examples of Superlativeness of the construction of Negativity* (emphasis added)

In the example, the military-related vocabulary “military exercise” and “line of defense” are intensified with superlatives and an adjective which conveys an additional meaning of importance. Because intensification is so closely related to and attached to the negative vocabulary, the Negativity is here evaluated as the news value in construction.

As stated in section 4.1.1, in two of the articles of the 2017 set, images constructed the news value of Eliteness, and one did not have images at all. However, in Wall Street Journal’s case, Negativity and the negative vocabulary are supported by two of the embedded images, one which portrays a Finnish light artillery squad in 1940, and the other an image of the marines’ troops in 2015. As can be evaluated from the captions, the images do not yield any new information about the topic at hand: tunnels, or Finland’s preparedness. See captions below:

A Finnish light artillery squad on patrol in January 1940. **The three-month winter war against the Soviet Union has long informed Finland’s defensive planning.**

Royal British Marines and **Marines from Finland** take part in multinational exercises in Sweden in 2015.

**Example 7.** *Captions from the Wall Street Journal article* (emphasis added)

The source of both images is wire services, and the images do not have a clear connection for example to the people interviewed for the article or the places represented. They appear to support the story-like



structure of the news, indicating a place in history for the topic. In other articles, the construction of Negativity did not include images, and the IBTimes article did not include images at all.

### 4.1.3 Unexpectedness

The label Unexpectedness refers to features that are depicted as deviating from norms or typical phenomena. Like many news values, this is also interpretational and depends on the –what is unexpected in some cultures and for some audiences, might not be such for others. In this particular case, it can be said that the vastness and alleged usage of underground tunnels in Finland can be interpreted as an unexpected piece of information highlighted in each article. Unexpectedness is especially foregrounded in the Wall Street Journal’s and Express’ news articles.

Express’ article construes Unexpectedness with typography by emphasizing words describing the tunnels. In the headline and sub-headline, two words are written in capital letters, emphasizing the atypical size of the tunnels: “EU country builds massive underground CITY to prepare for Russia [sic] invasion. AN UNDERGROUND city is being prepared for habitation in case Russia invades Europe during a military exercise” (O’Brien, 2017).

In the Wall Street Journal’s article’s headline, the news value of Unexpectedness is construed through the idiomatic expression “go underground” that is accompanied by the lead image portraying an underground entrance. This deviance from norms is further established in the main text by word choices such as “subterranean city”, “subterranean defenses”, and “labyrinth”.

It is important to note that the direct quotations of Elite individuals, however, do not include expressions which would indicate that these tunnels, for these Finnish people, are deviance from the norm, as shown in Example 8 below.

“The soldiers make sure we will have the advantage underground if they ever come to us wanting a fight,” said a former Finnish Defense Ministry Official. ... “Today if you build a new underground space, it must be capable of being transformed into a defense center within days,” said Ilkka Vahaaho, an employee of the city of Helsinki’s real estate department.

**Example 8.** *Example quotations in the WSJ article indicating the normality of the tunnels*

The deviance from the norm is detectable neither in the indirect nor the direct quotations of Finnish authorities, as seen in the example from Wall Street Journal article (Grove, 2017):

Finnish authorities say their system of civilian-military defense councils assures that national defense is considered at all levels of civilian life. That means preparing the whole population for the worst-case scenarios, said Janne Kuusela, the Defense Ministry's policy director. "The tunnel system we've built comes from our own lessons learned from the Second World War: You need to do what you can to keep your vital functions going even if you're being heavily bombarded," he said. "That's why they're there."

The existence of tunnels is naturalized in the quotations, and if the tunnels were somehow new and innovative, other linguistic resources would have been used for describing them. In Wall Street Journal's article, this set-up of unexpectedness (headline) vs. expectedness (quotations) creates a sense of polarity between the readers and the "other", who is also depicted as a minority. Therefore, there is a kind of making strange and peculiar that foregrounds the news value of Unexpectedness and increases the newsworthiness of the topic.

#### **4.1.4 Timeliness**

In the articles under analysis, it is clear that the tunnels and their existence is constructed as timely, placing the tunnels in connection to events that have taken place near the time that the news have been published, more specifically the then-upcoming Zapad exercise in 2017. According to Bednarek and Caple (2017), temporal references and tense are quite undeniable features of constructing Timeliness, but those features construct Timeliness only when placing an event near the time that the news item is published (p. 98). Tense is also subject to conventions in the sense that for example in headlines, present tense is the preferred choice even when the news covers an upcoming event, or one in the past (ibid.). Therefore, it is not always easy to make the distinction whether the construction of Timeliness is connected to general style conventions or is a case-specific choice. Conventions that are part of discourse practice by default should be discussed as such.

Some of the headlines under analysis follow the abovementioned conventions. In the 2017 set of articles, the headlines are written in the present tense even though the actual building of the tunnels has taken place in the past and the news content does not largely specify any ongoing activities regarding the

tunnels. However, there are some inconsistencies in the construction of Timeliness, as shown in Example 9 below.

IBTimes	Present / - (no sub-headline) / Past tense
WSJ	Present / Present / Present continuous
Express	Present / Present progressive / Present perfect
MailOnline	Present continuous / present continuous / present continuous

**Example 9.** *Overview of tenses in headlines and leads in 2017 set*

As seen in the example above, in the MailOnline article, the present continuous tense is used consistently which highlights the situation as ongoing and emphasizes its continuity, thus foregrounding Timeliness perhaps slightly more compared to the other articles. The differences, however, are not grand: Wall Street Journal also foregrounds Timeliness with present tense and mentions the upcoming military exercise Zapad in the sub-headline and the lead, and Express mentions military exercise, as well as uses, present perfect in the lead which leaves open whether the construction of the tunnel even, in fact, has ended yet. IBTimes, on the other hand, does not have a sub-headline at all, but more interestingly, the headline is in present tense but the lead and main text are mainly in the past tense. This is often the case, as seen in the 2018 news articles, that the use of past tense increases the longer the time it is from the event the news discusses. However, in IBTimes' case, the article has been published on the same date as others, and therefore it can be argued that Timeliness is not as foregrounded news value in IBTimes' news article as in others.

The next section introduces the results of the analysis of the 2018 set of articles.

#### **4.2 News values in articles published around the summit of Putin and Trump in 2018**

The foregrounded news values in the 2018 articles were Negativity and Eliteness. Timeliness and Unexpectedness were also found primary, but the articles under analysis differed in their foregrounding: Timeliness was not as significant a news value in the articles published on the 23<sup>rd</sup> of July 2018 (9News, news.com.au, and New York Post) as it was in the CNN.com news. This can be due to the date of publication, as CNN.com published its cover on the tunnel before the President's special summit, and the

others after that. In the articles published after the summit, only ABC mentioned the summit in its lead. On the contrary, the news articles published on the 23<sup>rd</sup> of July foregrounded the news value Unexpectedness, instead. Next is the description and examples of the constructed news values of Eliteness, Negativity, Unexpectedness and Timeliness in the articles published around the special summit of Trump & Putin in 2018.

#### 4.2.1 Eliteness

Eliteness is a foregrounded news value in the 2018 articles since it is present often in leads and repeatedly constructed in the main texts. Leads are the most important parts of news because on them readers base their choice on whether they should continue to read the whole news article or not. It “frames the event, summarizes the story, construes newsworthiness and attracts readers” (Bednarek & Caple, 2012a, p. 97).

Eliteness is constructed in three news articles by references to important and influential people, as shown for example in the lead of the CNN news article: “On the busy streets of Finland’s capital Helsinki, security preparations are underway to **host a much-anticipated summit between US President Donald Trump and Russian leader Vladimir Putin**” (Chance & Burrows 2018, emphasis added). In addition to CNN, the 9News and ABC news articles had similar constructions in their lead, with ABC differing only slightly by referring to Vladimir Putin as the “Russian counterpart” of Trump.

Some may argue that in these leads, Timeliness would be a more prominent news value than Eliteness, but in this case, specifically, Timeliness constructs on the meeting of elite persons, and therefore the Eliteness is analyzed here as the main foregrounded news value. It is not the meeting that is important, but the part of who is meeting who. This idea can be verified by imagining if the members of the elite would have been replaced with less important persons, for example, if the persons meeting in Helsinki would have been, for example, chief executive officers. Therefore, I argue that Eliteness is one of the main news values in this news article instead of Timeliness.

In addition to leads, the articles include direct quotes from Finnish officials. A descriptive example of this is the CNN article, listed in Example 10 below.

1. ...officials in Helsinki say ...
2. ... said Karim Peltonen of the Finnish National Rescue Association, ...
3. ... Peltonen said ...
4. Western leaders openly blame ...
5. Moscow denies involvement ...
6. ..., something Trump said ...
7. The Kremlin said ...
8. But analysts say ...
9. President Trump, who says ...
10. ... recently suggested he would discuss ...
11. ... analysts say ...|
12. ... said Charly Saloniuss-Pasternak, of the Finnish Institute of International Affairs.

**Example 10.** *Elite sources in CNN news article in 2018 set*

There are 12 Elite sources in total referred to in the CNN.com news article about the tunnels, but half of them are generally known entities, such as “Western leaders”, “Moscow” and “Kremlin” referring to Russia/Russian leaders, and President Trump three times. Others, less familiar, are described by naming the institutions they represent (“Finnish National Rescue Association”, “Finnish Institute of International Affairs”) to clarify their status. It is not surprising that Trump is the most often quoted Elite source, but surprisingly there were no direct quotes of him. Furthermore, even though the number of direct quotes was low, Trump was more frequently referred to than the experts who are familiar with the topic of the news: tunnels and Finland’s international affairs.

Not all news articles used as many elite sources. 9news, the shortest of the articles under analysis, had no quotations from Putin or Trump and included only one quoted elite source: Peltonen from the Finnish National Rescue Association. 9news was, however, analyzed constructing as much Eliteness as others because of the length of the article: evaluated proportionally Eliteness was nevertheless foregrounded. On the other hand, NYP and news.com.au did not refer at all to Finnish authorities, and, instead, included not only indirect quotations but also images of the leaders Putin and Trump as well as added one indirect and direct quotations from a Finnish foreign minister at the time, Timo Soini, that were not included in other news articles of the 2018 set, see Example 11.

Last week, **Finland’s foreign minister Timo Soini** warned that Russia might try to carve out a peacemaker role for itself following the summit.” ... “I think that after the World Cup and after this summit, there will be no such thing (like Crimea),” said Mr Soini.” ... “(Moscow) might surprise in other ways...because they have much more in hand to give up now than what they had back then. They might be a peacemaker in Ukraine, in Syria, in nuclear weapons.”

**Example 11.** *Three unique elite source quotations in NYP and news.com.au* (emphasis added)

There are significant differences in the construction of Eliteness between the articles. NYP and news.com.au emphasize members of the high elite in the construction of Eliteness. Other news articles do not refer to Finnish ministers at all. Furthermore, ABC does not quote Trump and Putin, the highest elite, directly at all – only mentions their summit in the lead and states in the caption of an image of Putin that “Russia has made thinly veiled threats...”. Thus, in the ABC news article, Eliteness is constructed mainly through quotations from Finnish authorities: from the beforementioned Salenius-Pasternak, the Finnish security and defense policy expert, who was also quoted directly by CNN, and—more interestingly—from Jani Pitkänen, the rescue department director of the city of Helsinki.

#### 4.2.2 Negativity

Negativity is one of the foregrounded news values in the articles under analysis as it is construed in the headline of each and occurs frequently in the main texts. Headlines are one of the most important elements of news, and in online news even more so as the headlines are what invite the reader to open the news article at all. In online news websites, headlines often function as clickbaits that entice visitors to click the headline to open the article. Therefore, features that are visible in the headline can be considered as foregrounded as they are the features which readers see first. As stated above, all the headlines under analysis constructed the news value of Negativity, bolded in the example below:

CNN	Helsinki’s bunker city: How Finland has <b>survived</b> in <b>Russia’s dark shadow</b>
ABC	Helsinki’s sprawling underground tunnel network <b>offers shelter</b> from <b>Russia’s potential threat</b>
9News	Underground Helsinki <b>bunkers ready</b> for <b>Russian invasion</b>
news.com.au	How Helsinki is preparing for <b>a potential attack</b> from Russia
NYP	This tiny European country is already <b>prepping for WWII</b>

**Example 12.** *Negativity in the headlines of the news published in 2018* (emphasis added)

Here, it is important to notice that the headlines portray the tunnels underground Helsinki with Russia and its speculated possible invasion or potential threat it poses to Finland, or, as stated in the NYPs' headline, as means of getting ready for World War 3. The potentiality of Russia's attack constructs Negativity also in the fourth headline of the example. So, to say, the headlines are constructed in a manner which implies that the existence of tunnels underground Helsinki is mainly for defense purposes, against Russia.

In the first sentence of Example 12, Negativity is constructed with the verb choice "survive" and the phrase "dark shadow" which is a figure of speech implying the great size and proximity of Russia, as well as its alleged unpleasantness of sorts. In the second sentence of the example, the verb "offer" and noun "shelter" alone does not have negative connotations—on the contrary, it could be said that the headline would construct Positivity because there is a mean for protection. However, accompanied by the noun phrase "potential threat" the sentence constructs Negativity in the sense that it implies implicitly that Russia indeed is such a source of threat for which a great construction process has been carried out to prepare such means for protection.

Furthermore, in the first and third sentences of the example, the underground tunnels are referred to as bunkers. *Bunker* as a noun is defined as "a shelter, usually underground, that has strong walls to protect the people inside it from bullets or bombs" ("Bunker," n.d.). By using that noun, the headline constructs Negativity since war generally reminds people of casualties and other tragic situations and consequences that war entails. The main purpose of the underground tunnels is for civil defense which is a different area of defense that focuses on protecting people from natural disasters rather than "bullets or bombs".

In the main texts, Negativity is constructed through choices of words by using war-related vocabulary, using for example the previously mentioned "bunker", and "last line of civilian defense". There were also descriptive words that have semantically a negative connotation rather than a neutral one. For example, in the CNN article, the Negativity is highlighted further, as shown in the following quote from the middle (Chance & Burrows 2018):

Finland **struggled** for more than a century to **assert its independence** from the Kremlin. With its long Russian border and **painful history** of Russian invasion, Finland has strived to balance the

interests of its giant neighbor and its own independence. ... There are no illusions here about **what the biggest threat** to Finland is (emphasis added).

Negativity was constructed also in the NYP and new.com.au in a similar manner through adjectives which describe Finland as weak (“fragile”, “tiny”), nouns that indicate its position as a victim (“potential target”, “vulnerable position”), verb choices that imply hardship in dealing with Russia (“struggled ... to assert independence”, “suffered a history of invasion”), Finland is stated as “suspicious of Russia”, and that there is a possible closeness of war (“prepared for war”, “prospective outbreak of war”) which itself creates negative emotions in readers. In NYP and news.com.au articles, there was also this binary opposition between winners and losers in stating Mr Putin as the “real winner” of the summit (“This Tiny European Country”, 2018; news.com.au 2018):

Putin emerged as the real winner from the Helsinki summit last week. Instead of standing up to the Russian dictator, Mr Trump blamed his own country for tense US-Russia relations, called his own US intelligence officials liars, and refused to denounce Russia for interfering in US democracy.

The concept of losing, because of victimization of Finland, is here understood as building of the lexical field of confrontation and loss.

The Negativity was occasionally supported and accompanied by Superlativeness which emphasized the Negativity similarly to the 2017 set. This was seen in expressions that emphasize the closeness of Russia both culturally and historically (“share a long border, “long history”) as well as Russia’s greater size in comparison (“its larger neighbour”, “to the smaller country”, “the smaller country”, “a more powerful neighbouring country”). The threat and negativity are emphasized in a quote from an Elite source: “I think that after the World Cup and after this summit, there will be no such thing (like Crimea), said Mr Soini”. It is important to notice that the negativity here, is in also supported by the construction of Eliteness because a similar sentence from a bystander would not be viewed with as much credit.

#### **4.2.3 Unexpectedness**

Instead of Timeliness, NYP and news.com.au articles foregrounded the news value of Unexpectedness. As stated before, the two articles had only minor differences between them, as it was only the headlines and news images that mainly were different. However, where the NYP headline constructed the news value of Unexpectedness using the adverb “already”, referring to the preparation taking place earlier than



expected, news.com.au constructed the news value through the lead image of the tunnels and the sub-headline implying the atypicality of the tunnels by using adjectives “elaborate” and “world” that together insinuate complexity and vastness of the tunnels.

Both articles construct Unexpectedness by juxtapositioning the familiar “what Finland is known for” with describing elements that not only describe Finland geographically in relation to Russia but also, through negative vocabulary, foreground Finland as “tiny” and threatened. More on the construction of Negativity in previous section 4.2.2.

In the two similar articles there is also a juxtaposition of political neutrality and preparedness for war that are highlighted by separating compound sentences in two and using the conjunction “but” that is used to connect coordinate elements: “Finland has an ongoing policy of political neutrality, and was recently ranked as the world’s happiest country. But it’s always prepared for war” (“This Tiny European Country” 2018; news.com.au 2018). The preparedness for war was not mentioned as explicitly in the other articles.

#### 4.2.4 Timeliness

Timeliness is construed when the news is presented to the reader as temporally relevant (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 64; 2012a, p. 42). Verb tenses can be used to create Timeliness if the used tense is used to link the topic of the news to a continuous flow of events. In this article set, Timeliness is constructed mainly, not through references to time, but through verb tenses, giving an account of events that sets the existence of the tunnels to a place in the history and relation with the present and future events, making the topic of the news a part of “the temporal flow between happenings” (Bednarek & Caple, 2017, p. 99).

For example, the ABC news article includes not only present continuous but also past tense: the headline is written in the present tense (“offers shelter”), but the lead is written in the past tense, recapitulating the events from the past week, and connecting the topic of the news to a wider context in time. In the main text, the topic is also set within a wider continuance of events by using present, past, and future tense within one compound sentence: “Finland **is** part of the European Union, but not NATO, and Russia **has** previously **made** thinly-veiled threats **if** the Finns **were to join** the US-backed military alliance” (Millar & Hawke, 2018, emphasis added). The topic of the article is constructed as newsworthy through

Timeliness by describing entities in the past tense (date undefined), explaining the current situation, as well as the possible courses of events in the future.

Future is also included in the ABC article in the form of future continuous in a conditional sentence at the end. It is interesting that the article ends with a type 1 conditional sentence that begins with the adverbial clause including the subordinating conjunction “if”, followed by an independent clause that is in future continuous tense: “And if Russia do come knocking, the people of Helsinki will be well-prepared” (Millar & Hawke, 2018, emphasis added).

However, the use of all tenses, past, present and future, I evaluate as constructing the Timeliness and emphasizing the importance of the topic to the reader, as it not only sets the tunnels existence and usage in a temporal flow, but this flow is relevant in selling the news to the reader as worthy. What is interesting is that, in this case, the past tense constructs the Timeliness through political relationships depicted ongoing. And none of the articles, regardless of the temporal flow, mention that the topic has been in the news already in 2017.

In addition to explicitly constructing Timeliness, there are implicit forms of it, too. For example, in CNN, Timeliness is also constructed throughout by referring to the upcoming meeting between Trump and Putin. I argue that in this case, similarly to the 2017 set, the Timeliness is constructed implicitly through references to Elite entities and their actions. In the CNN case, in the headline: “Helsinki’s bunker city: How Finland has survived in **Russia’s dark shadow**” (emphasis added), the underground tunnels in Finland are constructed as timely and significant with Russia. Timeliness is foregrounded further in the lead paragraph that mentions the then-upcoming summit between the President of the United States and the President of Russia. In the middle of the CNN article, the upcoming meeting is referred to again: “It’s not clear what Trump and Putin will agree here in Helsinki on Monday, ...”, as well as concludes to it at the end: “The United States, ..., could soon follow suit” (Chance & Burrows, 2018). Without this implicit construction of Timeliness, the tunnels would have appeared less significant to the reader.

### 4.3. Summary of the foregrounded news values

This section summarizes the findings of the DNVA analysis and discusses the results together with previous research results. According to the results of the analysis, both the 2017 and 2018 sets

foregrounded the news values of Eliteness, Negativity, Timeliness and Unexpectedness. There were differences in the emphasis on Unexpectedness: in 2017 set, Express and Wall Street Journal articles, and in 2018 set NYP and news.com.au news articles foregrounded Unexpectedness more than others. Furthermore, in the 2018 set, the outlets differed regarding the construction of Timeliness, as, it was not as a significant news value in the articles published on the 23<sup>rd</sup> of July 2018 (9News, news.com.au, and New York Post) as it was in the CNN.com news published in 15<sup>th</sup> of July 2018. This can be due to the date of the publication since CNN covered on the tunnel prior to the Presidents' special summit, and the other outlets after that. In the articles published after the summit, only ABC mentioned the summit in its' lead.

In both sets, Eliteness was construed firstly by mentioning elite nations and secondly through quotations from the members of the elite. The longer the article, the more frequent the quoting and thus more prominent the construction of Eliteness. Some articles included also an image of a member of the elite, but only in one case it was the lead image: in the Express article. For a written news piece, there are some conventions which guide the structure of news and can influence this outcome. The reason behind the frequency's correlation to article length appears to be in the conventions regarding the informational structure of a news story in general, and therefore paying further attention to it here is not justified.

In both sets, Negativity was mainly construed through word choices, such as war-related words or words that portrayed Finland as having prolonged difficulties with Russia, being weak and a victim. Superlativeness was found to support the construction of Negativity, as shown in the examples from the Wall Street Journal's article in 4.1.2. In the 2018 set, the opposition between winners and losers was considered constructing negativity as it supported the lexical field of confrontation. This was most explicit in the NYP and news.com.au.

Timeliness, in Bednarek & Caple's framework, does not only refer to recency: it is about "how an event is established as temporally relevant to the reader at the time of publication/broadcast" (2017, p. 64). Interestingly, in both news sets, Timeliness is implicitly constructed with a timely event, the Zapad in 2017 and the summit of Trump and Putin in 2018. However, there were differences in the emphasis on Timeliness, as in 2017, IBTimes' headline differed from the others in its tense, using past tense to describe something others described as continuous.

The findings of this study both are inconsistent with previous findings as well as deviate from some of their results. The previous DNVA studies have shown that there can be similarities and differences between Western news outlets in the construction of news values, suggesting that it does not require great cultural differences between countries for differences in news value construction to occur (see e.g., Fruttaldo & Venuti, 2017). The study by Fruttaldo and Venuti (2017) showed that there were differences in the construction of Negativity. As shown in the results of this study, regardless of the various geographical locations of the news outlet, the outlets were quite similar in which news values were constructed and how. No differences in the construction of Negativity were found. This suggests that news value construction is not dependent on the geographical location of the news discourse.

The results of this study also partly conform to that of Fruttaldo and Venuti (2017). As explained briefly above and in chapter 3.2, according to Fruttaldo and Venuti the US and UK outlets differed from the Italian in the foregrounding of Negativity (2017, p. 95)—a result, which appeared to arise from constructing the case in the articles as a battle. Similarly to Fruttaldo and Venuti's (2017) findings, it was found in this study that, in the news article published by NYP and news.com.au in 2018, there was an insinuation of a battle by referring to winners and losers, and thus the construction of Negativity. This binary opposition was in fact similar to that which Li found in 2009 (p. 104), as the news articles constructed the opposition in a similar manner between NATO and a nation, in this case, Russia. NYP and news.com.au were the most prominent in foregrounding this binarity, and the articles were nearly identical, as mentioned before in section 3.4.

Furthermore, the results of this study's DNVA analysis seem to support the findings of Bednarek and Caple who found that photos construed the same news values as the linguistic devices (2012b, p. 112). In this study, if a news article included an image, the news values of the images supported the construction of news values of Eliteness, Negativity, Unexpectedness and Timeliness. There were, for example, no images that would construct Personalization or Positivity. However, as the focus of this study was on foregrounded news values, the matter would require more research to confirm.

Negativity has been a common news value in research results before (see e.g., Bednarek & Caple, 2012b; 2014, Dahl & Fløttum, 2017) but the values of Eliteness and Personalization appear to be more prone to

changes. In another study conducted by Bednarek and Caple, for the construction of Eliteness, the elite members' geographical closeness to the readers was found to be more relevant than the elite members' closeness to the event (Bednarek & Caple, 2014, p. 149). Their quantitative DNVA study on Western news discourse and foreign news found that even when reporting on an unfortunate event that has occurred abroad, the news value of Eliteness is constructed through elite members geographically closer to the reader than to the event. Furthermore, their study suggested that eye-witness statements of ordinary people are only rarely excluded, suggesting its possible importance as a news value in international news reporting. Now, the results of this study suggest that personalization and eye-witness quotes are not always a central news value news, nor is the Eliteness always constructed through elite members geographically close to the reader. In this study, the majority of the quotations were found to be from elite sources close to the event, from Finnish experts or authorities. Personalization was not found as a foregrounded news value in the results, nor were there any cases of eye-witness quotations.

The next section discusses the findings of DNVA analysis from a CDA point of view before the conclusion.

## 5 Discussion

This section recapitulates the research questions of this study and aims to link the DNVA findings to the CDA model. After that, I describe how the online news discourse under analysis sustains the social and political wrongs by multiplying the spread of the one-sided view of the matters. As mentioned before, this study is a qualitative critical discourse analysis of English-language online news discourse applying Fairclough's three-dimensional model and DNVA for the analysis. The research questions were:

1. What news values do the chosen articles foreground?
2. What similarities and differences are there between outlets under analysis?
3. What are the social or political wrongs this discourse sustains?

The first two questions were answered in section 4 when presenting the results of the DNVA analysis and comparing the findings between outlets and with previous studies. This section aims to discuss the last question: what social and political wrongs does this discourse sustain?

First, it is best to elaborate briefly on the connection between the constructed news values and society, or discourse on a larger scale. As stated in section 2.2.1, in this study texts are viewed as spaces where meets both cognition and representation of the world and social interaction (Fairclough, 1997). An online news article is an image of the world produced in the journalistic process (in that process journalist is not the only one responsible for the outcome) as well as a representation of the cognitive processes of the publication time and context: what and how news entities view as worthy of publishing and what they consider as an interesting topic to the audience. The news articles which have been intentionally produced specifically for communicating information, as intentional social interaction, are a product of a process of selection and editing (see section 2.2.1).

The news articles under analysis were international news and categorized as such by the outlets, with one exception, IBTimes which categorized it as special-topic news. According to previous research made already in the 90s, there is a bias in the selection of international news (McQuail, 2005):

It was repeatedly confirmed that news (whether press or TV) in more developed countries does not typically give a great deal of space to foreign news (except in specialist or elite publications). Foreign news is largely devoted to events in other countries that are large, nearby and rich, or

connected by language and culture. It is also narrowly focused on the interests of the receiving country. ... Agencies collect news 'abroad' with a view to what will interest the ultimate 'home' audience, and the foreign news editors of home media apply even more precise set of criteria of a similar kind. The result is to largely eliminate news of distant places that is not dramatic or directly relevant to the receiving nation (p. 262–263).

This bias can be assumed to influence the construction of the newsworthiness of international news, resulting in the foregrounding of the interests and news values of the receiving country. Based on the results of the DNVA it can be stated that in 2017 and 2018 the underground tunnels in Helsinki were viewed as an interesting topic to English-speaking audiences when the existence of the tunnels is connected to Russia. Why Russia is the interest of the receiving audiences cannot be thoroughly discussed here but demands further research.

However, in this case, it can be concluded that the US, UK, and Australia-based news outlets were uniform in how they constructed the newsworthiness by foregrounding Negativity, Eliteness, Unexpectedness, and Timeliness. It did not have a significance whether the news outlet was commercial or national, online-focused or print. The question of what resulted in similar news published by several outlets within the same language area (but not necessarily within the same societal or cultural area) requires more research to answer as even discussing online news discourse is out of the scope of this paper. It may be the use of news agencies, or a more general discourse practice caused by the change in the monetizing system of journalism (see history of the move to online e.g., Jones & Salter, 2012, pp. 34–54). The business model of the historical news industry in which “subscriptions and classified advertising made a newspaper’s business model sustainable and profitable” (Jones & Salter, 2012, p. 35) does not work the same way for monetizing the online environment and search engines. This is a problem from the critical discourse analytical perspective: has news discourse been influenced by, for example, marketization to the extent that pursuing clicks or newsroom practices are affecting the construction of news values?

It also can be concluded that the news articles under analysis incorporate a one-sided view of the matters. Shortly after the English news were published in 2017, Finnish news outlets reported on the international attention the tunnels got in foreign news outlets. There were news for example in *Iltalehti* (Salonen, 2017), *Helsingin Sanomat* (Kivimäki, 2017) and *Ilta-Sanomat* (Halonen, 2017a; Halonen, 2017b), all of which

covered the story with emphasis on the source. See Example 12 and the Helsingin Sanomat headline, which is a good example of how the Finnish news tended to refer to the source:

Helsingin Sanomat (2017)

Original: Suuri amerikkalais-lehti raportoi Helsingin tunneleista: ”Venäjä suunnittelee suurinta sota-harjoitusta vuosiin, ja naapuri-maa Suomi pakenee maan alle”

Translation: Large American paper reported on the tunnels in Helsinki: “Russia is planning the biggest military exercise in years, and the neighbor country Finland escapes underground”

**Example 13.** *Example headline of Finnish news on the media attention the tunnels received*

The validity of the quotations in the MailOnline article (Burke, 2017) and Wall Street Journal article (Grove, 2017), stating that Finland is building underground tunnels to protect itself from Russian invasion, were denied in the Finnish news media by the interviewed persons (Keto-Tokoi, 2017). One of them, interviewed for the original article, stated that his comments have been intentionally misinterpreted by the journalist, referring that there was a mix-up between what is considered long-term precautionary civil defense preparations and preparations for war (Keto-Tokoi, 2017).

The same finding was reported in Helsingin Sanomat article in 2017 in which Janne Kuusela, one of the elite members quoted in the English-language articles, said that he was surprised that the English-language news article connects the tunnels to Zapad (Palojärvi, 2017). Finnish politician Ilkka Kanerva also commented on the matter in the article stating that the English articles give a wrong impression in claiming that tunnels would have been constructed just now (Palojärvi, 2017). Another politician, Matti Vanhanen, stated that the tunnels have been built mostly for other purposes entirely and that Finland is quite an exception in the world in reserving spaces for civil defense purposes (Palojärvi, 2017), perhaps referring to the likelihood of the abovementioned mix-up.

A Finnish MTV reporter wrote a commentary stating that the claims made in the Wall Street Journal’s article in 2017 were strange, and because of the gained media attention on the matter, the story’s consequences to the political situation were viewed as unfortunate, and the made allegations irreversible (Sipinen, 2017). Russian news media reported on the tunnels, too. The government-owned Radio Sputnik



said that the preparations were based on “unfounded suspicions” and “paranoid fear” (Sputnik, 2017). In the article, Radio Sputnik quoted a Russian military expert, Baranets, who said that “the West's overwhelming propaganda about the 'Russian military threat' has given rise to a kind of social schizophrenia in Norway and Sweden, and now it's spreading in Finland,” (Sputnik, 2017), stating also that such constructed threat aims to “convince the population of the necessity to abandon the non-alignment policy and join NATO” (Sputnik 2017). According to Helsingin Sanomat, after the publication of the original English-language news the Finnish Ministry of Defense was contacted about the matter several times, mostly by Russian sources (Palojärvi, 2017).

Finnish news outlets thus appeared to represent the matter in a contradictory way to the English ones, giving the impression that in 2017 set English news outlets were ‘wrong’ in their headlines and articles. The problem from a critical discourse analytical view here is not the matter of which outlet is wrong, and which is right: it is out of the scope of this paper to answer that question. The problem found here is that the readers of the English-language news articles about the tunnels underground in Finland will most likely never know of the views presented in Finnish news outlets, yet the news spread to many other outlets. Nor were these contradictory statements in any way visible in the 2018 set, and the CNN said instead: “In the event of a military attack, officials in Helsinki say the entire population of 640,000 could be sheltered in the solid rock bunkers, equipped with food, bedding, sanitation, hospitals – and even an underground ice hockey rink” (Chance & Burrows, 2018).

Therefore, it can be said that the news articles were biased in their representations of the matters of the world, linking the construction of tunnels to war and threat of Russia. Furthermore, it appears that the ideological standpoints of the 2017 set were not questioned when publishing the 2018 set, and the matters were presented from the same perspective. These findings are in line with the previous CDA studies, introduced in 2.2.2. There are qualitative studies which suggest that the use of binary representation conforms to the ideologies of the society and foreign policy of the nation where the outlet is geographically based (Wang, 2017) but unfortunately this study has limitations that prevent focusing on the source of the ideological standpoint and binary representations in the articles under analysis.

Nor can this study make any assumptions regarding the unintentionality/intentionality of the phenomenon regarding the tunnels underground Helsinki: such is irrelevant in resolving the issue as well as impossible to research. Furthermore, regardless of previous studies stating certain news as fake and biased or outlets as ideologically driven and politically influenced, audiences are still oppressed under the ideologies and power of journalistic media. Not much has changed and naming this specific news as false or specific sources as unreliable would be unsustainable claims that would not empower anyone. And after all, some outlets are viewed as more reliable than others, for example, in the United States in 2022, over 50 % of the respondents considered Wall Street Journal as a very or somewhat reliable source (Watson, 2022). Fortunately, readers have not lost their trust in the news but have become more critical of information, and media literacy is on the rise.

More important would be to focus on observing the discourse practices that generate and sustain this situation, enabling news outlets to maintain the power relation as it is. Because previous studies, such as the ones introduced in section 2.2.2 have shown that newspapers still appear to report on international topics subjectively, perhaps freeing journalism of the demand for ‘truthfulness’ and viewing it as profoundly a performance that could balance the power relations? It might well be the case that if news production was seen **and** spoken of as unable to produce representations of the world as if they were ‘true’ and objective then maybe there would be a focus on understanding the limitations of journalism and all representations alike. There would be a demand for discussing the limitations of journalists and outlets outside truthfulness, and perhaps more possibilities for open discussion.

## 6 Conclusion

This CDA study focused on analyzing the online news discourse through DNVA of English language online news articles about the underground tunnels in Helsinki. The study carried out a discursive news value analysis of 9 online news articles about underground tunnels under Helsinki published in 2017 and 2018, finding that regardless of the outlet's geographical location and the year between their publication, the two sets were unified in their construction of newsworthiness. The articles foregrounded the news values of Eliteness, Negativity, Timeliness, and Unexpectedness, having only slight differences in the emphasis of Unexpectedness and Timeliness. The construction of Timeliness in both sets was based on an event that took place before or after the publication, the Zapad in 2017 and the summit of Trump and Putin in 2018. Differences in the construction of Timeliness appeared to base on the publication date of the news with the event it was covered with.

Regardless that there had been a year in between, the news values were similar between outlets, and according to this study, the construction of news values is not dependent on the time (year), or geographical location of the news outlet (Australia, US, UK). It seems that news value construction is correlated with the culture in which the topic is published—not the geographical location but further research is needed to confirm that. It was noted that in the 2018 set there were two nearly identical articles published by different outlets geographically distant but under the same corporate owner. Unfortunately, the reason for this similarity was out of the scope of this paper to determine.

The results of this study are in line with the previous CDA studies in finding that there are ideological standpoints and binary oppositions in the articles under analysis. For example, there was binary opposition constructed between winners and losers, and the articles represented the tunnels as having been constructed with Russia's threat and war in mind, even though the connection was denied by the interviewed elite members. This study concluded that the English news language news under the analysis spread one-sided view on matters, as if from one perspective, thus sustaining the inequality of news discourse. The main cause, however, is not in outlets but in discourse practices in general, and there is a need for more research on the discourse practices of online news discourse. Also, it was pointed out that perhaps switching the expectation for truthfulness to the view of journalism as a performative discourse could help in empowering audiences.

There were shortcomings to this study and the dilemma regarding its limitations was continuously present. For example, leaving visuals of news out of the analysis altogether would not have respected the view I have on the importance of visuals and multimodality when it comes to news and especially the power of news. “Visuals do not simply supplement, or package, news, editorials or features, but form part of the ideas about the world, concepts and attitudes that are communicated” (Machin & Polzer, 2015, p. 1). Visuals are an essential part of creating interpretations of the world, and such should have as much significance as language itself. However, the scope of this study made it impossible to delve thoroughly into that part of multimodality, even more so because of the nature of the world of online news. Digital media environments and the development of digital platforms have changed communication of news, offering a wider variety of choices regarding for example framing and use of visual tools, but also supplementing a fixed reading path and demanding platform consistency—all of which could have been taken better into consideration when analyzing the construction of newsworthiness and how news is sold. But because a thorough discussion was not possible, this study focused on analyzing the foregrounded news values in general. For those interested in the subject of today’s visual media, Machin and Polzer’s *Visual Journalism* (2015) could work as an introduction.

Search engines are one of the main means of distributing news online (Jones & Salter, 2012, p. 31) which was the reason to collect the articles as I did. But it is an important aspect to take into consideration when evaluating the results of this study that search engines tend to foreground search results of corporate news sites (ibid). Search engines are not “technically neutral tools in relation to content” (ibid). Even though the data collecting method included searching with different search terms and going through all search result pages, the search results have been filtered according to search algorithms. For example, in Google, which uses PageRank, the importance and popularity of a webpage affect its position in the search results (Jones & Salter 2012):

The PageRank algorithm takes the search terms inputted, say ‘Iraq war’, finds pages with these terms, assesses the location matrix and the number and ‘importance’ (which is not publicly defined) of links to that page from other websites, and then delivers the results in accord with these factors. The result of this is that those websites with greater market power are more likely to be viewed. In this case, even Google has a tendency to consolidate existing inequalities between information sources (p. 31–32).

And Google is not the only one: all search engines have their algorithms. Because of this relationship, search engines are thus bound to influence the construction of newsworthiness; either on a more local level in which the writing of news articles conforms to the existence and functioning models of search engines (because monetizing system builds partly on them), and perhaps later on a broader scale, on the level of discourse practice of online news, if the features become normal and conventional. This could have had more focus in this study.

Furthermore, from the perspective of both CDA and the construction of newsworthiness, it must be noted that news type and news category did not receive enough attention in this study as they should have. It would have been interesting to add to this study to go further on that topic by researching, for example, all online news about Finland within an outlet and comparing the construction of newsworthiness to find out whether, for example, soft news differs from hard news. This study could also be expanded to focus on observing the discourse practices that generate and sustain this situation, enabling news outlets to maintain the power relation as it is.

## References

- ABCa. (n.d.). *ABC History*. Retrieved from <https://about.abc.net.au/abc-history/>
- ABCb. (n.d.). *How the ABC is run*. Retrieved from <https://about.abc.net.au/how-the-abc-is-run/>
- Bednarek M. (2016). Voices and values in the news: News media talk, news values and attribution. *Discourse, Context & Media*, 11, 27–37.
- Bednarek, M. & Caple, H. (2012a). *News Discourse*. London: Continuum International Publishing.
- Bednarek, M. & Caple, H. (2012b). ‘Value added’: Language, image and news values. *Discourse, Context & Media*, 1(2-3), 103–113.
- Bednarek, M. & Caple, H. (2014). Why do news values matter? Towards a new methodological framework for analysing news discourse in Critical Discourse Analysis and beyond. *Discourse & Society*, 25(2), 135–158.
- Bednarek, M. & Caple, H. (2017). *The Discourse of News Values: How News Organizations Create Newsworthiness*. Oxford University Press.
- Bednarek, M., Caple H., & Huan C. (2021). Computer-Based Analysis of News Values: A Case Study on National Day Reporting. *Journalism Studies*, 22(6), 702–722. DOI: 10.1080/1461670X.2020.1807393
- Bell, A. (1991). *The Language of News Media*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Bloomgarden-Smoke, K. (2014, March 19<sup>th</sup>). How ‘Journalism Crack’ Conquered the Internet. *Observer*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://observer.com/2014/03/maionline/>
- Broersma, M. (2010). Journalism as performative discourse: The importance of form and style in journalism. In V. Rupar (ed.), *Journalism and Meaning-Making: Reading the Newspaper* (pp. 15-36). Cresskill, NJ: Hampton Press.
- Burke, D. (2017, July 14th). Finland prepares to go underground if the Russians attack: Massive tunnel network underneath Helsinki is developed for soldiers to ‘gain an advantage’ if there is an invasion. *Daily Mail*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-4697300/Finland-prepares-underground-Russians-attack.html>
- Caple, H., & Bednarek, M. (2013). *Delving into the discourse: Approaches to news values in journalism studies and beyond*. University of Oxford, Oxford: Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism

- Caple, H. & Knox, J. (2015). A framework for the multimodal analysis of online news galleries: What makes a “good” picture gallery?. *Social Semiotics*, 25, 292–321. DOI: 10.1080/10350330.2014.1002174.
- Carvalho, A. (2008). Media(ted) discourse and society. *Journalism Studies*, 9(2), 161–177. DOI: 10.1080/14616700701848162
- Chance, M., & Burrows, E. (2018, July 15th). *Helsinki’s bunker city: How Finland has survived in Russia’s dark shadow*. CNN Digital. <https://edition.cnn.com/2018/07/14/europe/helsinki-tunnels-defense-trump-putin-intl/index.html>
- CNN. (n.d.). *About CNN digital*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://edition.cnn.com/about>.
- Cobos, D. (2017, July 14<sup>th</sup>). *Helsinki Prepares for Russian military exercise by going underground*. International Business Times. Retrieved from <http://www.ibtimes.com/helsinki-prepares-russian-military-exercise-going-underground-2566017>.
- Cotter, C. (2010). *News talk: Investigating the language of journalism*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Dahl, T. & Fløttum, K. (2017). Verbal–visual harmony or dissonance? A news values analysis of multimodal news texts on climate change. *Discourse, Context & Media*, 20, 124–131. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dcm.2017.09.003>.
- DOW. (n.d.). *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://www.dowjones.com/products/wsj/>
- Ethelb, H. (2016). The people or the police: Who to blame? A study investigating linguistic and textual devices journalists use in framing news stories. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 6(12), 2245–2253. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0612.02>
- Express. (n.d.). *About Us*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://www.express.co.uk/about-us>
- Fruttaldo, A. and Venuti, M. (2017). A cross-cultural discursive approach to news values in the press in the US, the UK and Italy: The case of the Supreme Court Ruling on Same-Sex Marriage. *ESP Across Cultures*, 14, 81–97.
- Fairclough, N. (1995) *Language and power*. Longman. (Original work published 1989).
- Fairclough, N. (1997). *Critical discourse analysis: The critical study of language*. Longman. (Original work published 1995)
- Galtung, J. & Ruge, M. (1965). The structure of foreign news. *Journal of Peace Research*, 1, 64–90.

- Grove, T. (2017, July 14<sup>th</sup>). Beneath Helsinki, Finns prepare for Russian threat. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <https://www.wsj.com/articles/beneath-helsinki-finns-prepare-for-russian-threat-1500024602>.
- Halonen, A. (2017a, July 15th). WSJ: Puolustusvoimat harjoitteli Helsingissä torjumaan samanlaista iskua, jonka Venäjä teki Krimillä. *Ilta-Sanomat*. Retrieved from <https://www.is.fi/kotimaa/art-2000005292634.html>.
- Halonen, A. (2017b, July 17th). Jos vihollinen hyökkäisi, piilee Helsingin alla valtava etu. *Ilta-Sanomat*. Retrieved from <https://www.is.fi/kotimaa/art-2000005293484.html>.
- He, J. & Caple, H. (2020). Why the fruit picker smiles in an anti-corruption story: Analyzing evaluative clash ad news value construction in online news discourse in China. *Discourse, Context & Media*, 35, 1–11.
- Huan, C. (2016). Leaders or readers, whom to please? News values in the transition of the Chinese press. *Discourse, Context & Media*, 13, 114–121. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dcm.2016.05.005>
- IBT. (n.d.). *About us*. <https://www.ibtimes.com/corporate/about>
- IBTMedia. (n.d.). *About International Business Times*. <https://corp.ibt.com/brands-ibtimes>
- Johnson, J. (2022, March 1st). *Worldwide desktop market share of leading search engines from January 2010 to January 2022*. Statista. Retrieved from <https://www.statista.com/statistics/216573/worldwide-market-share-of-search-engines/>
- Jones, J. & Salter, L. (2012). *Digital journalism* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Sage.
- Keto-Tokoi, J. (2017, July 18th). Helsingin kaupungin päällikkö korjaa jenkkihlehden julkaisemia tietoja tunneleiden sotilaskäytöstä: "Täysin tarkoitushakuista". *Aamulehti*. <https://www.aamulehti.fi/kotimaa/helsingin-kaupungin-paallikko-korjaa-jenkkihlehden-julkaisemia-tietoja-tunneleiden-sotilaskaytosta-taysin-tarkoitushakuista-200271916/>
- Kivimäki, A. (2017, July 15<sup>th</sup>). Suuri amerikkalaislehti raportoi Helsingin tunneleista: ”Venäjä suunnittelee suurinta sotaharjoitusta vuosiin, ja naapurimaa Suomi pakenee maan alle”. *Helsingin Sanomat*. Retrieved from <https://www.hs.fi/kaupunki/art-2000005292338.html>
- Kress, G. (2009). *Multimodality: A social semiotic approach to contemporary communication*. Routledge.
- Kress, G. & van Leeuwen, T. (2001). *Multimodal Discourse: The Modes and Media of Contemporary Communication*. Oxford UK: Oxford University Press.



- Li, J. (2009). Intertextuality and national identity: discourse of national conflicts in daily newspapers in the United States and China. *Discourse & Society*, 20(1), 85–121.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926508097096>
- Makki, M. (2019). ‘Discursive news values analysis’ of Iranian crime news reports: Perspectives from the culture. *Discourse & Communication*, 13(4), 437–460.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1750481319842453>
- Makki, M. (2020). The role of ‘culture’ in the construction of news values: a discourse analysis of Iranian hard news reports. *Journal of Multicultural Discourses*,  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/17447143.2020.1786573>
- McQuail, D. (2013). *Journalism & and society*. Sage.
- McQuail, D. (2005). *McQuail's mass communication theory* (5th ed.). Sage.
- Machin, D. & Polzer, L. (2015). *Visual journalism*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- MailOnline. (n.d.). *About MailOnline*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from  
<https://www.dailymail.co.uk/home/article-10538781/About-MailOnline.html>
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Threat. In *Merriam-Webster.com thesaurus*. Retrieved March 31, 2022, from  
<https://www.merriam-webster.com/thesaurus/threat>
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Invasion. In *Merriam-Webster.com thesaurus*. Retrieved March 31, 2022, from  
<https://www.merriam-webster.com/thesaurus/invasion>
- Merrill, C. & O’Key, S. (2020, August 28th). *CNN Digital celebrates 25 years*. CNN Digital.  
<https://edition.cnn.com/interactive/2020/08/specials/cnn-digital-25-years/>
- Millar, L., & Hawke, J. (2018, July 22nd). *Helsinki's sprawling underground tunnel network offers shelter from Russia's potential threat*. ABC News. <https://www.abc.net.au/news/2018-07-22/helsinki-underground-tunnel-system-shelter-from-russian-threat/10022486>
- MTV. (n.d.). *History*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://www.mtvuutiset.fi/yritys/en/history>
- NewsCorp. (n.d.). *News Corp remains the largest print and digital publisher in Australia*. Retrieved from <https://www.newscorpaustralia.com/events/7333-2/>
- News.com.au. (n.d.). *Help*. Retrieved from <https://www.news.com.au/help>
- News.com.au. (2018, July 23rd). *How Helsinki is preparing for a potential attack from Russia*.  
<https://www.news.com.au/technology/innovation/military/how-helsinki-is-preparing-for-a-potential-attack-from-russia/news-story/95a617a8d57aa36ebc098f846f5723fe>
- NYP. (n.d.). *About New York Post*. <https://nypost.com/about-new-york-post/>

- O'Brien, Z. (2017, July 16th). EU country builds massive underground city to prepare for Russia invasion. *The Daily Express*. <https://www.express.co.uk/news/world/829424/Finland-EU-Helsinki-underground-CITY-Russia-invasion-fears-Putin-Military-drills-Nato>
- Palojärvi, E. (2017, July 17th). Kansainvälinen media kuumensi puolustusministeriön puhelinlinjat kyselyillä Helsingin tunneleista – WSJ kuuli ”maanalaisista puolustuksista” entisiltä virkamiehiltä. *Helsingin Sanomat*. <https://www.hs.fi/politiikka/art-2000005294531.html>
- Päivälehdien Museo. (n.d.). *Iltä-Sanomat 90 vuotta. Eilen, tänään ja huomenna*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://www.paivalehdienmuseo.fi/nayttelyt/ilta-sanomat-90-vuotta-eilen-tanaan-ja-huomenna/>
- Sanoma. (n.d.). *What we do*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from <https://www.sanoma.fi/en/what-we-do/portfolio/>
- Salonen, J. (2017, July 15<sup>th</sup>). Ulkomaiset lehdet uutisoivat Helsingin tunneleista: "Suomi varautuu Venäjän hyökkäykseen". *Iltalehti*. [http://www.iltalehti.fi/kotimaa/201707152200266933\\_u0.shtml](http://www.iltalehti.fi/kotimaa/201707152200266933_u0.shtml)
- Shojaei, A., Youssefi, K., & Hosseini, H. S. (2013). A CDA approach to the biased interpretation and representation of ideologically conflicting ideas in western printed media. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 4(4), 858–868.  
<https://search.proquest.com/docview/1428281915?accountid=13031>
- Sipinen, M. (2017, July 27th). *Wall Street Journal teki kiusallisen pohjatyön Putinin vierailulle – Helsinki-juttu linkitettiin heti Natoon*. MTV.fi. <https://www.mtv.fi/uutiset/kotimaa/artikkeli/wall-street-journal-teki-kiusallisen-pohjatyon-putinin-vierailulle-helsinki-juttu-linkitettiin-heti-natoon/6515828#gs.z0dS0OQ>
- Sputnik. (2017, July 18<sup>th</sup>). *Finland's Cold War tunnels: Russia's 'calm line' to cure this 'schizophrenia'*. The Sputnik News. <https://sputniknews.com/europe/201707181055638707-finland-tunnels-russia>
- Wheeler, B. (2012, January 27<sup>th</sup>). *How the Daily Mail stormed the US*. BBC.  
<http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-16746785>.
- WT Editorial. (2017, July 17th). To the Finland station. *The Washington Times*.  
<https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2017/jul/17/editorial-to-the-finland-station>.
- Zhang, L. and Caple, H. (2021). The newsworthiness of Li Na – A critical comparative analysis of Chinese and international news media. *Language and Communication*, 77, 70–80.

- Zhang, W. & Cheung, Y. L. (2022). The hierarchy of news values – A corpus-based diachronic and cross-cultural comparison of news reporting on epidemics, *Journalism Studies*, 23(3), 281–301. DOI: 10.1080/1461670X.2021.2021104
- Ranji, B. (2013, April 18th). Hesari’s history in a nutshell. *Helsinki Times*.  
<https://www.helsinkitimes.fi/lifestyle/6038-hesari-s-history-in-a-nutshell.html>
- This tiny European country is already prepping for WWII. (2018, July 23rd) *New York Post*.  
<https://nypost.com/2018/07/23/this-tiny-european-country-is-already-prepping-for-wwiii/>
- WarnerMedia. (n.d.). *Our brands*. Retrieved April 20, 2022, from  
<https://www.warnermedia.com/us/brands>
- Wang, C. (2017). Victimhood in the face of media ideological battle: A critical discourse analysis on the British media’s coverage of stabbing incidents in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. *Journal of Holy Land & Palestine Studies*, 16(1), 79–98. DOI: 10.3366/hlps.2017.0153
- Watson, A. (2022, March 22<sup>nd</sup>). *Credibility of major news organizations in the U.S. 2017-2022*. Statista. Retrieved from <https://www.statista.com/statistics/239784/credibility-of-major-news-organizations-in-the-us/>
- Wodak, R., & Meyer, M. (2001). *Methods of critical discourse analysis* (1st ed.). Sage.  
<https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9780857028020>
- Wodak, R. & Meyer, M. (2009). Critical Discourse Analysis: History, Agenda, Theory, and Methodology. In R. Wodak, & M. Meyer (Eds.), *Methods for Critical Discourse Analysis* (pp. 1–33). Sage (2nd revised edition).
- Wodak, R. (2001). What CDA is about – a summary of its history, important concepts and its developments1. In *Methods of critical discourse analysis* (pp. 1-13). SAGE Publications, Ltd,  
<https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9780857028020>
- Wood, R. (2018, July 23rd). *Underground Helsinki bunkers ready for Russian invasion*. 9News.  
<https://www.9news.com.au/world/helsinki-underground-bunkers-ready-in-case-of-russian-invasion/305c5ca2-0558-4d57-879a-85629ac3e5f1>